# INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR STANDARDISATION ORGANISATION INTERNATIONALE DE NORMALISATION ISO/IEC JTC1/SC29/WG11 CODING OF MOVING PICTURES AND AUDIO 

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC29/WG11 MPEG98/N2425

Atlantic City - October 1998

Source: Audio and Test subgroup<br>Status: Approved<br>Title: MPEG-4 Audio verification test results: Audio on Internet<br>Authors: Eric Scheirer, Sang-Wook Kim, Martin Dietz

## Table of Contents

1. Introduction .....  2
2. Test motivation .....  2
3. Codecs under Test ..... 3
4. Test Material .....  .5
5. Test methodology .....  .7
6. Test stimuli .....  .7
7. Test sessions .....  8
8. Data Analysis .....  8
8.1 Data receipt and verification .....  .8
8.2 Subject reliability .....  .9
8.3 Test site comparison .....  9
8.4 Comparison of codecs .....  9
8.5 Test Results ..... 12
8.6 Figures ..... 13
9. Conclusions ..... 32
9.1 Test A ..... 32
9.2 Test B ..... 32
9.3 Test C\&D ..... 32
10. ANNEXES ..... 34
10.1 Annex 1: Test Schedule ..... 34
10.2 Annex 2: Test tape organization ..... 35
10.3 Annex 3: Codec verification ..... 36
10.4 Annex 4: Pre-selected and selected items for the Audio on Internet test ..... 37
10.5 Annex 5: Selection Panel report ..... 38
10.6 Annex 6: Instructions for scoring and voting sheets ..... 42
10.7 Annex 7: List of the "pseudo-randomisation" of each test ..... 44
10.8 Annex 8. Tables from the statistical analysis ..... 46

## 1. Introduction

The MPEG-4 Audio coding tools cover a bit rate range from $2 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ to $64 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ with a corresponding subjective audio quality that needs to be evaluated. It was recognized that the verification tests should first address applications that are potentially of great interest for users. To this end, three important applications for MPEG-4 audio are being addressed in the verification tests:

- Internet Audio applications (6 to $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ ),
- digital audio broadcasting on AM modulated bands (16 to $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ ) and
- speech applications

Four different sites offered to run the listening tests: Sony (Japan), Mitsubishi Elec. America (USA), NTT (Japan) and Samsung AIT (Korea). The final results analysis was performed by MIT (USA).

The purpose of this document is to describe the procedures that have been followed and to present the outcome of the verification tests on Audio on Internet application. The remaining verification tests are handled in separate documents.

## 2. Test motivation

The highly increasing need for music transmission over networks like the Internet is the background for this test evaluating recent MPEG coders at bit rates suitable for analog modems and ISDN connections.
The comparisons of interest are:

- to compare the Twin-VQ and HILN tools provided by MPEG-4 with existing technique for transmission of audio at bitrates below $10 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$.
- to compare the HILN and AAC tools provided by MPEG-4 with existing technique for transmission of audio at bitrates between 10 and $20 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$.
- to compare the AAC-based tools for large step scaleability provided by MPEG-4 with existing tools (unscaled AAC and MPEG Layer 3). The scaleable system provides a mono/stereo scaleable system, offering $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ mono, $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo and $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo in one $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ bitstream. The purpose of this test is to evaluate the performance of the scaleable coding scheme in comparison with traditional unscaled coding.
- to compare the fine granule scaleable tool AAC-BSAC provided by MPEG-4 with unscaled AAC coding to evaluate the impact of the small step scalability functionality on the sound quality.


## 3. Codecs under Test

### 3.1 Test overview

The test was divided in four groups of coding scheme/bitrates.

- Group A tests the codecs at 6 and 8 kbit/sec mono and contains HILN, Twin-VQ and MPEG Layer-3. The reference for this Group A is MPEG Layer 3 (MP3).
- Group B tests the codecs at 16 kbit/sec mono and contains HILN, AAC, and G. 722 at 48 $\mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ as a reference.
Group C and D belong to the same coding system, but are separated because the lowest layer is a mono layer while the higher layers are stereo layers.
- Group C tests the mono core layer of the AAC large step scaleable Coder against a unscaled AAC coder and MPEG Layer 3. The reference coder for this Group C is MPEG Layer 3 (MP3).
- Group D tests the upper layers of the scaleable coders against unscaled coders and contains AAC, AAC large step scaleable coder, AAC-BSAC fine granule scaleable coder and MPEG Layer 3. The reference coder for this Group D is MPEG Layer 3 (MP3). The AAC-BSAC coder has no counterpart in the C-Test since it is based on a unscaled stereo AAC coder and therefore does not provide mono/stereo scaleability.

It should be noted that in MPEG standards only the decoder is normative and that the MPEG4 encoders supplied for this test are developmental and further optimization is expected. It must be stressed that some of the coders in the test are parametric coders which are not designed for some natural sounds which are present in several items used in this test. The codecs which were tested are listed below:

|  <br> \#codec | Codec | mode | sampling <br> rate <br> of operation | total <br> bitrate <br> (layer <br> bitrate) |
| :---: | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| in kbit/s |  |  |  |  |$|$| A1 | HILN | mono | 8 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A2 | TwinVQ | mono | 16 |
| A3 | MPEG Layer 3 (MP3) | mono | 8 |
| B1 | HILN | mono | 16 |
| B2 | AAC | mono | 16 |
| B3 | G722 | mono | 16 |
| C1 | AAC | mono | 24 |
| C2 | AAC scal | mono | 24 |
| C3 | MPEG Layer 3 | stereo | 24 |
| D1 | AAC | stereo | 24 |
| D2 | AAC | stereo | 24 |
| D3 | AAC scal | stereo | 24 |
| D4 | AAC scal | stereo | 24 |
| D5 | AAC scal (BSAC) | stereo | 24 |
| D6 | AAC scal (BSAC) | stereo | 24 |
| D7 | MPEG Layer 3 | stereo | 24 |
| D8 | MPEG Layer 3 |  | 46 |

### 3.2 Codec details

### 3.2.1 HILN

This coder is the HILN parametric coder (Harmonic and Individual Lines plus Noise) according to MPEG-4 Audio FCD (N2203, N2205). It operated at a fixed bit rate of $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ (mono, 8 kHz sampling rate) and $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{s}$ (mono, 16 kHz sampling rate) respectively.

### 3.2.2 Twin-VQ

The TwinVQ (Transform-domain Weighted Interleaved Vector Quantization) coder is the coder newly designed as a result of the AAC-TwinVQ convergence work, whose specification are described in the FCD. It quantizes a part of the $1024 / 128$ point MDCT coefficients at 16 kHz sampling rate, and is directly plugged into the MPEG-4 AAC system.

### 3.2.3 AAC

The AAC coders (Advanced Audio Coding) used in this test were MPEG-2 AAC Main profile encoders according to ISO/IEC 13818-7. AAC was used with three different bitrates: 24 $\mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (mono), $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (stereo), $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (stereo). The sampling rate was 24 kHz for all bitrates.

### 3.2.4 AAC scal

This coder is an AAC mono/stereo large step scaleable coder according to the MPEG-4 Audio FCD. It operates at 24 kHz sampling rate at all bitrates. Neither the PNS tool (Perceptual Noise Substitution) nor the LTP tool (Long Term Prediction) was used. The base layer
operates at $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ mono. Each of the two enhancement layers adds a $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo enhancement, resulting in bitrates of $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (mono), $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (stereo), $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (stereo).

### 3.2.5 AAC scal (BSAC)

This an AAC coder with a small step scaleable BSAC noiseless coder (Bit Sliced Arithmetic Coding). It operates at 24 kHz for all bitrates. Neither the PNS nor the LTP tools was used. The BSAC coder in this test was not based on a mono/stereo scaleble system, but on a standard MPEG-2 AAC coder operating at $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo. Therefore neither the results at $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ nor $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ can be directly compared to the AAC scaleable coder, but only to the unscaled AAC coder.

### 3.2.6 G.722

The G. 722 is a generic audio coder recommended by ITU-T for multimedia communication. In this test the 48 kbps version was used.

### 3.2.5 MPEG-Layer 3 (MP3)

For the A test, Layer 3 was used in the proprietary ultra-low sampling rate extension called 'MPEG 2.5 ' at 8 kHz sampling rate for $8 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ coding. For the B, C and D test ( $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ mono, $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo, $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo MPEG-2 Layer 3 was used.

## 4. Test Material

A call for new stereo test materials was sent out during Tokyo MPEG meeting. This resulted in a contribution of more than 90 items. Prescreening was performed during the Dublin meeting in order to reduce the amount of work for the final selection process. 39 representative items have been selected from the contributed items for the coding process. Prescreening results are shown in N2279. During pre-selection, panelists suggested to do level adjustment on some items. Level adjustment was performed by Univ. Hannover and resultant items were placed at Univ. Hannover ftp site. Coding was performed by the codec provider using the pre-selected materials. The decoded files were uploaded to the FhG-IIS ftp site. FhGIIS prepared CD-ROMs for final selection and preparation and delivered to AT\&T.

### 4.1 Selection panel

The process of identifying and selecting the most critical items, typical items and training items to be used in the formal test was delegated to a selection panel and carried out at AT\&T. The selection panel was comprised of:

- J. Johnston
- V. Lam
- S. Quackenbush
- N. Zacharov
- M. Fellers

For the final selection of test excerpts it was proposed to have half of the selected items as critical excerpts and the other half as typical excerpts. Each critical and typical item group is proposed to consist with speech, single instrument, pop, classic and complex sound excerpts.

### 4.2 Chosen item

The selection panel recommended four sets of test items for the A, B, C and D test. The selection panel also recommended specific items to be used during the training phase of the listeners for each test. The definition of 'typical' and 'critical' as well as additional details on this selection process can be found in Annex 5.

### 4.3 Typical items for A, B, C, and D test

|  | Test A | Test B | Test C | Test D |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 38 | 01 | 38 | 01 |
| Single instrument | 16 | 11 | 16 | 02 |
| Pop | 08 | 29 | 19 | 37 |
| Classical | 31 | 18 | 22 | 31 |
| Complex | 33 | 09 | 28 | 33 |

Within the selection process for Test A, item 12 (Glockenspiel) was removed from the list of items since it suffered substantial bandwidth limitation when processed by some of the coders (see selection panel report, Annex 5).

### 4.4 Critical items for A, B, C, and D test

|  | Test A | Test B | Test C | Test D |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 01 | 13 | 13 | 13 |
| Single instrument | 11 | 05 | 03 | 11 |
| Pop | 15 | 15 | 14 | 10 |
| Classical | 07 | 22 | 07 | 18 |
| Complex | 39 | 34 | 33 | 20 |

### 4.5 Training items

The training items, proposed by the selection panel, were chosen to be different from the items used during the formal tests. The codecs used in the training items were proposed in order to cover the whole range of quality that will be encountered during the tests.

|  | Test A | Test B | Test C | Test D |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 13 | 38 | 01 | 38 |
| Single instrument | 03 | 04 | 11 | 12 |
| Pop | 37 | 14 | 15 | 29 |
| Classical | 18 | 07 | 18 | 07 |
| Complex | 34 | 20 | 35 | 34 |

## 5. Test methodology

- Subjective assessment of sound quality according to ITU-Recommendation BS.562.3

This methods use a five grade scale for scoring:

## BS.562.3 Quality scale

5 Excellent
4 Good
3 Fair
2 Poor
1 Bad

The Audio and Test group recommend the use of this scale as a continuous scale with one decimal place.
Within each test (A,B,C,D), the coders were compared to a bandlimited reference. The bandwidth of this reference was chosen in a way that its bandwidth was equal to the bandwidth of the coder with the highest bandwidth.

## 6. Test stimuli

In the A and B test, the sequence type was R (Reference)- A (Coded). In the C and D test, the sequence type was R-A-R-A.

| Experiment group | A | B | C |
| :---: | :---: | :--- | :--- |
| sequence type | R-A | R-A | R-A-R-A |
| scoring | BS.562.3 |  |  |

where R: reference signal(original), A: coded material

In experiment A and B, for scoring, 5 seconds are given. The graphical example of sequence type is shown below:


For experiment C and $\mathrm{D}, 3$ seconds are given for scoring. The graphical example sequence type R-A-R-A is shown below:


## 7. Test sessions

In experiment $A$ and $B$, the total length of test session is less than 21 minutes. However, in experiment C mono and D , the total length of sequence is longer than 30 minutes. To ensure fatigue did not affect the results, C mono and C stereo test were split into sessions of approximately 18 to 26 minutes. That is 2 sessions for the C mono test and 4 sessions for C stereo test. Pseudo randomization of test stimuli was applied to minimize the number of times each codec configuration occurred in a test session, and therefore to mix the audio quality throughout the test. The pseudo-randomization table is shown in Annex 7.

## 8. Data Analysis

### 8.1 Data receipt and verification

Data were received as several Excel spreadsheets from the four test sites. These spreadsheets were converted to text form, and several Perl scripts were used to convert the textual data and the codec and item order keys to a case-by-case freeform data file. Each line of this data file consisted of ten columns, as follows:

```
site subject age sex tape session trial codec item grade
```

All four tests were grouped together in this file. The file has 6910 cases, which is the correct total (40 subjects for tests $A$ and $B$ at 30 trials/subject +41 subjects for test $C$ at 30 trials/subject +41 subjects for test D at 80 trials/subject $=6910$ trials in all).

The data file was imported into the statistical analysis tool SPSS for Windows v7.5. This tool was used for all subsequent analyses.

Several cross-tabulations were conducted to ensure proper data unrolling. There were 400 trials for each of codecs 1-6, and 410 for each of codecs $7-17$, which is correct. The codec $x$ item cross-
frequency count was compared to the test plan and found correct. The subject $x$ codec cross-frequency count was compared to the test plan; one error was found and fixed. After this, data organization was believed to be accurate.

The raw data, Perl scripts, and analysis $\log$ can be made available according to the future tests of the MPEG-4 Test group.

### 8.2 Subject reliability

Listener reliability was evaluated by ensuring that each listener could consistently distinguish between the original sound and the coded sound. t-tests were performed for each listener over the listener's aggregate responses to all coded items, to test that the responses differed from 5 (maximum). This is not a strong criterion, since the reference was not hidden to listeners and they were instructed to score the coded examples with scores less than 5. All listeners had mean scores different from 5 with $\mathrm{p}<01$. No listeners were rejected on this criterion.

A stronger criterion is to ensure that the listeners could make consistent distinctions between codecs. For each subject, a one-way ANOVA was conducted for each of the tests in which they participated. A subject would be retained if they showed significant distinctions between codecs on half or more than half of the tests in which they participated.

Four subjects were rejected on this basis (A10, M5, M6, S15) as shown in Table 1, Annex 8. The remaining subjects were retained and used for subsequent analyses.

### 8.3 Test site comparison

An overall comparison of test sites was conducted to determine the correctness of grouping results across test sites. The results are shown in Figure 1 and Table 2, Annex 8. As shown there, there were consistent differences between scores depending on test site, in an interaction with the test. Thus, the data must not be grouped together and analysed as one group; rather, the data are partitioned as follows:

Test A/B - Site 1; Test A/B - Sites 2 and 4; Test C/D - Site 2; Test C/D - Sites 3 and 4.
Within each of these groups, there are no significant differences in the scoring based on test site.

However, after rejecting the subjects in the listener-reliability post-hoc test above, only 7 subjects are left at test site 2 , which is not enough to collect reliable statistics. Thus, the statistics for tests C and D will only be analysed at the joint site 3 / site 4 group.

### 8.4 Comparison of codecs

### 8.4.1 Test A - Site 1

(Figure 2; Table 3) Averaged over all ten items, MP3 at $8 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ and TwinVQ at $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed equivalently. Both performed better than HILN at $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. MP3 and TwinVQ performed between „fair" and „poor" on the 5-point scale; HILN performed at „poor".

Breaking down by item (Figure 3; Table 5), on $4 / 10$ items there were no differences among the codecs. On the other 6/10, MP3 performed better than HILN for each item. On 5/10 items, TwinVQ performed better than HILN. On one item, MP3 performed better than TwinVQ. There were no items on which any codec performed better than MP3. There were no items on which HILN performed better than any other codec.

Codec-by-codec comparisons by item are also provided to examine the consistency of behaviour by item (Figure 4). This is a qualitative, not quantitative, comparison. On this comparison, TwinVQ and MP3 are equally consistant, ranging from ,,poor" to nearly ,,good" depending on the item. HILN is more consistant, ranging from between „bad" and ,,poor" to between „poor" and „fair".

### 8.4.2 Test A-Sites 2 \& 4

(Figure 5; Table 4) Averaged over all ten items, MP3 at $8 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ and TwinVQ at $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed equivalently. Both performed better than HILN at $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. MP3 and TwinVQ performed between „fair" and „poor" on the 5-point scale; HILN performed between ,,poor" and „bad".

Breaking down by item (Figure 6; Table 6), on $2 / 10$ items there were no differences among the codecs. On the other 8/10 items, MP3 performed better than HILN for each item. On 5/10 items, TwinVQ performed better than HILN. MP3 performed better than TwinVQ on one item. There were no items on which any codec performed better than MP3. There were no items on which HILN performed better than any other codec.
(Figure 7) HILN was again the most consistent; items range from „bad" to between „poor" and „fair". For TwinVQ results range from between „bad" and „poor" to „fair"; for MP3 from between „bad" and "poor" to between „fair" and ,,good".

### 8.4.3 Test B - Site 1

(Figure 8; Table 7) Averaged over all ten items, G. 722 at $48 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed the best, followed by AAC at $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$, which was better in turn than HILN at $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. G. 722 performed at ,good" on the 5-point scale; AAC performed between „good" and „fair"; HILN performed between „fair" and ,"poor".

Breaking down by item (Figure 9; Table 9), there were significant differences among codecs on all but 1 item. On 5/10 items, AAC performed better than HILN; HILN performed better than AAC on 1 item. G. 722 performed better than AAC on 5 items; AAC performed better than G. 722 on 1 item. G. 722 performed better than HILN on 8 items; HILN performed better than G. 722 on 1 item.
(Figure 10) On this test, AAC was the most consistant, performing between „fair" or slightly lower and „good" or slightly better on each item. HILN was the least consistant, performing anywhere between just below ,"poor" to between ,,good" and „excellent". G. 722 was in the middle; it performed at various levels at and above „fair."

### 8.4.4 Test B-Sites 2 \& 4

(Figure 11; Table 8) Averaged over all ten items, G. 722 performed the best, followed by AAC, which was better in turn than HILN. G. 722 performed just below ,good" on the 5-point scale; AAC performed just above „fair"; HILN performed between „fair" and „poor".

Breaking down by item (Figure 12; Table 10), there were significant differences between codecs for all items. On $8 / 10$ items, AAC performed better than HILN. HILN did not perform better than AAC on any item. G. 722 performed better than AAC on 5/10 items. AAC performed better than G. 722 on 1 item. G. 722 performed better than HILN on 7 items; HILN performed better than G. 722 on 1 item.
(Figure 13) All three codecs showed inconsistent performance at this site. HILN was the least consistent, performing anywhere from ,,poor" to between ,,good" and ,excellent"; both G. 722 and AAC were slightly more consistant.

### 8.4.5 Test C - Site 3 \& 4

(Figure 14; Table 11) Averaged over all ten items, the standard version of AAC at $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed the best; it performed slightly better than the scalable version of AAC at $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. Both AAC codecs performed better than MP3 at $24 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. The AAC codecs performed between „fair" and „good" on the 5-point scale; MP3 performed between „poor" and „fair".
(Figure 15; Table 13) There were significant differences between codecs on all items. Scalable AAC performed better than MP3 on 7/10 items, and worse on no items. Regular AAC performed better than MP3 on 9/10 items, and worse on no items. Scalable AAC performed better than regular AAC on 1 item, and worse on 2 items.
(Figure 16) All codecs were approximately equally consistant. The two AAC codecs performed from between „poor" and „fair" to between ,,good" and „excellent" depending on item; the MP3 codec performed from between „bad" and „poor" to between ,,fair" and ,,good".

### 8.4.6 Test D - Site $3 \& 4$

(Figure 17; Table 12) Averaged over all ten items, the overall comparisons are as follows. The overall order was AAC 56 main, AAC 56 BSAC, AAC 56 scalable, MP3 56, AAC 40 main, AAC 40 scalable, MP3 40, AAC 40 BSAC. Each pairwise difference was significant except for AAC 56 - AAC 56 BSAC, AAC 56 BSAC - AAC 56 scalable, and AAC 56 scalable - MP3 56. Thus, especially at the lower end of this scale, the order of codecs is quite reliable.
(Figure 18; Table 14) A table of item-by-item pairwise difference follows. These differences were calculated using the Dunnett T3 post-hoc test of mean difference on 10 one-dimensional ANOVAs, one for each item. The indicated numbers show the number of items on which each codec performed better than each other codec at the $\mathrm{p}<.05$ significance level.

|  | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | AAC 40 | AAC 56 <br> scal | AAC 56 | AAC 40 <br> scal | AAC 56 <br> BSAC | AAC 40 <br> BSAC |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| MP3 40 |  | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 7 |
| MP3 56 | 7 |  | 3 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 1 | 10 |
| AAC 40 <br> AAC 56 <br> scal | 70 | 10 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 10 |
| AAC 56 <br> AAC 40 <br> scal | 10 | 3 | 0 | 8 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 10 |
| AAC 56 <br> BSAC <br> AAC 40 <br> BSAC | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 9 | 1 | 10 |

This table is read by rows; that is, on 7/10 items MP3 56 was judged statistically better that MP3 40; on $3 / 10$ items it was judged better than AAC 40.
(Figure 19) There were few items showing differences between AAC 56, AAC 56 scalable, and AAC 56 BSAC. Thus, these three methods give very similar performance on most items. Confirming the result above, AAC 40 BSAC was outperformed by most other codecs for nearly all items; there were no items on which AAC 40 BSAC performed better than any other codec.

### 8.5 Test Results

A list of informal questions to be answered in the test was provided on the test AHG reflector.

1. Test A: Which codec performed better?

TwinVQ performed better overall, and on $5 / 10$ individual items, in each test group. There were no items on which HILN performed better in either test group. TwinVQ and Layer 3 performed equally well overall, however TwinVQ needs $25 \%$ less bitrate.
2. Test B: Which codec performed better?

AAC performed better overall in both test groups. In one group, AAC performed better on $5 / 10$ items, and HILN performed better on $1 / 10$ items. In the other group, AAC performed better on $8 / 10$ items, and HILN performed better on no items.
3. Test C: Did AAC 24 main and AAC 24 kbps scalable perform similarly?

AAC 24 main performed slightly better $(\mathrm{p}=0.031)$ overall. There were not many item-by-item differences between these codecs; AAC 24 main performed better on $2 / 10$ items, and AAC 24 scalable performed better on $1 / 10$ items. The rather similar behaviour was expected due to the fact that, apart from some restrictions due to the scaleability feature, both coders are almost identical.
4. Test C: Did AAC coders perform better than MP3?

Both AAC coders performed much better overall and on most items compared to MP3.
5. Test D: How did AAC 56 compare to AAC scal 56?

AAC 56 performed better than AAC scal 56 overall, but performance was similar on almost all items. Each codec outperformed the other on one item.
6. Test D: How did AAC 40 compare to AAC scal 40 ?

AAC 40 performed better than AAC scal 40 overall, but performance was similar on almost all items. AAC 40 was rated higher than AAC scal 40 on one item.
7. Test D: How did AAC 56 compare to AAC BSAC 56 ?

These two codecs did not demonstrate statistical difference, although a trend $(\mathrm{p}=0.072)$ shows AAC 56 perfoming slightly better overall. AAC main 56 performed better on one item than AAC BSAC 56. Since BSAC didn't use a mono/stereo scaleable mode but a small step scaleable mode based on a stereo coder, these results cannot be compared directly to the AAC scaleable coder. It should also be noted that AAC BSAC 56 performed very well on all items except item 20, on which it performed untypically bad. Further investigations have shown that this degradation has been caused by a implementation bug. Therefore this item should not be considered in the evaluation of this codec.

## 8. Test D: How did AAC 40 compare to AAC BSAC 40?

AAC 40 performed much better than AAC BSAC 40 overall, and all 10 items individually. Since BSAC didn't use a mono/stereo scaleable mode, but an unscaled AAC coder these results cannot be compared directly to the AAC scaleable coder. The performance difference between AAC 40 and AAC BSAC 40 is significant.

### 8.6 Figures

Figure 1. Variance of scores at test sites


Figure 2: Site 1, Test A Overall results


Figure 3: Site 1, Test A item-by-item comparison


Item 15: Tracy Chapman


## Item 31: Folklore



CODEC


Item 16: Bass guitar


Item 33: Background Music


CODEC
Item 39: Mussorgsky + Applause


Figure 4: Site 1, Test A codec consistency


Figure 5: Site 2 \& 4, Test A overall results


### 8.6.1.1 Figure 6: Site 2 \& 4, Test A item-by-item comparison

## Item 1: English Female Speech



CODEC
Item 8: Contemporary Pop Music


CODEC

Item 7: Orchestral Piece


CODEC
Item 11: We shall be happy


CODEC

Item 15: Tracy Chapman


CODEC
Item 31: Folklore


CODEC


CODEC

Item 16: Bass guitar


Item 33: Background Music


CODEC
Item 39: Mussorgsky + Applause


Figure 7: Site 2 \& 4, Test A codec consistency


Figure 8: Site 1, Test B overall comparison


### 8.6.1.2 Figure 9: Site 1, Test B item-by-item comparison

Item 1: English Female Speech:


CODEC


CODEC

Item 5: Bagpipes


Item 11: Plucked Strings


CODEC

Item 13: Male German Speech


CODEC
Item 18: Classical Music


CODEC
Item 29: Pop Music


CODEC

Item 15: Pop Music


Item 22: Violin


CODEC
Item 34: French Speech + Music

codec

Figure 10: Site 1, Test B codec consistency


Figure 11: Site 2 \& 4, Test B overall results

8.6.1.3 Figure 12: Site 2 \& 4, Test B item-by-item comparison


Item 13: Male German Speech


CODEC
Item 18: Classical Music


CODEC
Item 29: Pop Music


CODEC

Item 15: Pop Music


CODEC
Item 22: Violin


CODEC
Item 34: French Speech + Music


CODEC

Figure 13: Site 2 \& 4, Test B codec consistency


Figure 14: Site 3 \& 4, Test C overall results


### 8.6.1.4 Figure 15: Site $3 \& 4$, Test $C$ item-by-item comparison



Item 16: Bass guitar


CODEC
Item 22: Violin


CODEC
Item 33: French Speech + Music


CODEC

Item 19: Accordion/Triangle


Item 28: Classic instruments


CODEC
Item 38: Male German Speech


CODEC

Figure 16: Site 3 \& 4, Test C codec consistency


Figure 17: Site 3 \& 4, Test D overall results


CODEC

### 8.6.1.5 Figure 18: Site 3 \& 4, Test D item-by-item comparison



Item 13: Male German speech


CODEC
Item 20: Percussion


CODEC
Item 33: French speech + Music


CODEC

Item 18: Classical Music


CODEC
Item 31: Classical Music


CODEC
Item 37: Jazz music


CODEC

Figure 19: Site 3 \& 4, Test D codec consistency



## 9. Conclusions

The following conclusions can be drawn from the test results:

### 9.1 Test A

- Twin VQ at $6 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ shows statistically the same quality as Layer 3 at $8 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$. Twin VQ is therefore a valuable MPEG-4 tool for improved coding efficiency at lowest bitrates.
- HILN at 6 kbit/sec shows a significantly worse average quality than Twin VQ and Layer 3 with the items used in this test. Further investigations (see document m4087) have shown, that the quality of HILN is highly dependent on the test material and is better than the quality of Twin VQ for some items. The selection process within this test, however, has been found to be correct in selecting the critical test items. Therefore the results of this test are a valid indication for the audio quality achieved when the coders are used as general audio coding systems on critical material. This leads to the conclusion that more work on HILN is required to improve the coding quality for critical material (see also test B).


### 9.2 Test B

- AAC at $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed 0.6 grades worse than G722, but operated at $1 / 3^{\text {rd }}$ of the bitrate. It can therefore be concluded that AAC is a valuable MPEG-4 tool for coding music signals at bitrates as low as $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$.
- HILN at $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ performed equal or worse than AAC at $16 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ for almost all items at both test sites. The test results also shows that the quality of HILN is again highly dependent on the test material (see also test A). This leads to the conclusion that more work on HILN is required to improve the coding quality for critical material.


### 9.3 Test C\&D

- At all three bitrates, AAC audio coding shows significantly better audio quality than MPEG Layer 3 (around 0.8 grades).
- The Large Step Scaleable System (AAC Scaleable) shows almost the same quality as unscaled AAC at the lower (mono) layer and about 0.4-0.5 grades worse quality at the higher (stereo) layers. Still
all Layers perform slightly better (highest layer) or significantly better (lower and mid layer) than MPEG Layer 3. Therefore the scaleable system shows good performance compared to older standards while providing the additional functionality of mono/stereo scaleable coding.
- The Small Step Scaleable System (BSAC) performed very well at the highest bitrate of $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ (item 20 should be excluded from the evaluation, see section 'Test Results'), which matches earlier results. On the lower bitrate of $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$, however, BSAC performed worse than expected. Although being mainly designed for bitrates from $40-64 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ mono at 48 kHz sampling rate, the BSAC tool is still expected to show reasonably good performance when going from $56 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo to $40 \mathrm{kbit} / \mathrm{sec}$ stereo at 24 kHz sampling rate. The conclusion therefore is that the integration of BSAC in the MPEG-4 audio framework needs further investigation to check whether the integration is incomplete or needs changes.


## 10. ANNEXES

### 10.1 Annex 1: Test Schedule

| Activity | Deadline | Responsibility | Comments |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Preselection, <br> Preprocessing \& Resampling | 13 July 98 | Dublin task group, Univ. Hannover |  |
| Coding process | 17 July 98 | Proponents |  |
| Decoding, Upsampling delivery to FhG ftp sites | 22 July 98 | Proponenets | bitstream, decoded materials, upsampled to 48 kHz by proponents. |
| Bitstream/bitrate \& decoding verification | 21 Aug. 98 | check site |  |
| Selection process | 31 July 98 | hosted by AT\&T <br> Selection panel from Nokia, Dolby, AT\&T |  |
| Test Setup/DAT <br> Tape preparation | 7 August 98 | Samsung |  |
| Grading phase | 21 Aug 98 | Sony (A,B,C) <br> Mitsubishi (A,B,C) <br> Samsung (A,B) <br> NTT ( C ) |  |
| Statistical analysis | 28 Aug 98 | MIT |  |
| Test report | 4 Sept 98 | Audio Subgroup |  |

10.2 Annex 2: Test tape organization

| Test | Tape | Time | Contents |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Test A | A1 | 31m35sec | training (15 sequences: 10 m 52 sec ) |
|  |  |  | test ( 30 sequences: 20 m 37 sec ) |
| Test B | B1 | 31m50sec | training (15 sequences: 11 m 57 sec ) |
|  |  |  | test (30 sequences: 19m44sec) |
| Test C | C1 | 56m50sec | training ( 15 sequences: 18 m 57 sec ) |
|  |  |  | test 1 (15 sequences: 19 m 05 sec ) |
|  |  |  | test 2 ( 15 sequences: 18 m 29 sec ) |
| Test D | D-Training | 54m15sec | training 1 ( 20 sequences: 27 ml 16 sec ) |
|  |  |  | training 2 ( 20 sequences: 26 m 50 sec ) |
|  | D1 | 25 m 12 sec | test (22 sequences: 25 mm 2 sec ) |
|  | D2 | 25m40sec | test (18 sequences: 25 m 40 sec ) |
|  | D3 | 26 ml 0 sec | test (19 sequences: 26 ml 10 sec ) |
|  | D4 | 24 m 50 sec | test (21 sequences: 24 m 50 sec ) |

### 10.3 Annex 3: Codec verification

NEC had verified every 39 bit streams for HILN, Twin-VQ, G. 722 and AAC-BSAC codecs. Samsung AIT had the task to verify the bitstreams and decoded and upsampled items of the AAC, MPEG Layer 3 and AAC scaleable codec for Audio on Internet. Samsung AIT did the verification with selected 10 test items for each experiment. Those results are shown on following table.

| Group \& \#codec | Codec | Average <br> bitrate | Minimum <br> bitrate | Maximum <br> bitrate | Remarks |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| A1 | HILN | 6000 | - | - |  |
| A2 | TwinVQ | 6000 | - | - |  |
| A3 | MPEG Layer 3 | 8034 | 8028 | 8074 |  |
| B1 | HILN | 16000 | - | - |  |
| B2 | AAC | 16118 | 16006 | 16321 |  |
| B3 | G.722 | 48000 | - | - |  |
| C1 | AAC | 24136 | 24006 | 24367 |  |
| C2 | AAC scal | 24103 | 24002 | 24315 |  |
| C3 | MPEG Layer 3 | 24057 | 24042 | 24134 | sampling rate is <br> different with <br> N2278 |
| D1 | AAC | 40171 | 39963 | 40298 |  |
| D2 | AAC | 56160 | 56027 | 56292 |  |
| D3 | AAC scal | 40171 | 40003 | 40263 |  |
| D4 | AAC scal | 56222 | 56004 | 56363 |  |
| D5 | AAC scal <br> (BSAC) | - | 34481 | 39869 |  |
| D6 | AAC scal <br> (BSAC) | - | 49605 | 56347 |  |
| D7 | MPEG Layer 3 | 40084 | 40071 | 40186 | sampling rate is <br> different with <br> N2278 |
| D8 |  |  |  |  |  |

The deviation of the bitrate can be explained by the use of the bit_resevoir.
10.4 Annex 4: Pre-selected and selected items for the Audio on Internet test

| item \# | filename | signal | $\begin{aligned} & \text { exp. } \\ & \text { A } \end{aligned}$ | exp. B | $\begin{aligned} & \text { exp.C } \\ & \text { mono } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { exp. C } \\ & \text { stereo } \end{aligned}$ | Rema rks |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | es03 | english female speech | C | Ty | TR | Ty |  |
| 2 | si01 | harpsichord |  |  |  | Ty |  |
| 3 | si02 | castanets0 | TR |  | C |  |  |
| 4 | si03 | pitchpipe |  | TR |  |  |  |
| 5 | sm01 | bagpipes |  | C |  |  |  |
| 6 | sc01 | trumpet solo and orchestra |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | sc02 | orchestral piece | C | TR | C | TR |  |
| 8 | sc03 | contemporary pop music | Ty |  |  |  | * |
| 9 | uhd2 | gula8 |  | Ty |  |  | * |
| 10 | te1 | Dorita |  |  |  | C | * |
| 11 | te2 | We shall be happy | C | Ty | TR | C |  |
| 12 | te6 | Glockenspiel |  |  |  | TR | * |
| 13 | te7 | Male German speech | TR | C | C | C | * |
| 14 | te8 | Suzanne Vega |  | TR | C |  |  |
| 15 | te9 | Tracy Chapman | C | C | TR |  |  |
| 16 | te13 | Bass guitar | Ty |  | Ty |  |  |
| 17 | te14 | Hyden Trumpet Concert |  |  |  |  |  |
| 18 | te15 | Carmen | TR | Ty | TR | C |  |
| 19 | te16 | Accordion/Triangle |  |  | Ty |  |  |
| 20 | te18 | Percussion |  | TR |  | C |  |
| 21 | te20 | George Duke |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 | te21 | Asa Jinder |  | C | Ty |  |  |
| 23 | te23 | Dalarnas Spelmansforbund |  |  |  |  |  |
| 24 | te25 | Stravinsky |  |  |  |  | * |
| 25 | te30 | aimai |  |  |  |  |  |
| 26 | te32 | Palmtop boogie |  |  |  |  |  |
| 27 | te36 | O1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 28 | te42 | Kids Drive Dance (KDD) |  |  | Ty |  |  |
| 29 | track76 | pop |  | Ty |  | TR |  |
| 30 | track78 | folklore |  |  |  |  |  |
| 31 | track82 | classic | Ty |  |  | Ty |  |
| 32 | track84 | classic |  |  |  |  |  |
| 33 | hexagon | background music | Ty |  | C | Ty |  |
| 34 | radiofr 1 | Radio France mixed speech/music | TR | C |  | TR |  |
| 35 | rfil | Radio France International : news, jingles, mixed |  |  | TR |  |  |
| 36 | app_guit | complex sound + applause |  |  |  |  |  |
| 37 | jazzdrum | complex sound | TR |  |  | Ty |  |
| 38 | kaest_mal |  | Ty | TR | Ty | TR |  |
| 39 | mussorg | complex sound + applause | C |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total | 39 | items |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

[^0]
# Report of the Ad-Hoc Selection Committee for MPEG- 4 Audio Internet Audio Tests: 

## Listening Panel, 6/29/98

J. Johnston
V. Lam
S. Quackenbush
N. Zacharov

Listening Panel, 6/30/98, 6/31/98
J. Johnston
N. Zacharov
M. Fellers
S. Quackenbush

## Listening Environment:

The listening tests were done at AT\&T Laboratories’ listening room, which is constructed using a floating floor and double walls. The listening setup consists of an SGI O2 R10000 computer running Irix, with an optical digital output connected through an interface to an Apogee 20 bit stereo DAC. The DAC output is connected through an Ashley 8-channel volume control and a Hafler P7000 amplifier to a pair of Snell C-V loudspeakers in the listening room. A PC keyboard and monitor is used to control the computer from inside the listening room. All presentation equipment except for speakers, keyboard and monitor are located outside the listening room.

The listening room has not yet been evaluated for full conformance to BS1116, but has been measured to have an NC8 noise floor. At at least one frequency the room appears to be too dead (i.e. near-anechoic) for full 1116 conformance. The room has previously provided very high sensitivity to codec impairments in informal 2-channel listening.

## Signal Characterization

The document N 2278 describes the material to be examined for possible inclusion in the final tests, and the constraints on selection of materials.

The constraints are that one of each of the following 5 categories of audio signals must be included as a "critical" signal, and one of each category as a "typical" member of that category. "Critical" signals are signals that show the worst absolute audio quality when processed by the coders in a given test. „Typical" signals are signals that show average perceivable distortion when processed by the coders in a given test. In addition, 4 signals were to be selected for training. As we found that training would be enhanced by the inclusion of one signal per category for training, we have expanded the training sequences to include one from each category, for a total of 5 training signals, for each of the four tests.

After some listening, we respectfully decline the invitation to make the critical signals the same across all 4 tests. We find that this would not result in the best sensitivity or balance for at least one or more of the tests.

First, we categorized the material according to the categories, as we did not have any guidance on signal type included in N2278. Our categorizations follow:

|  | Category |
| :--- | :--- |
| Speech | $1,13,38$ |
| Single Instrument | $2,3,4,5,11,12,16,17$ |
| Pop | $8,10,14,15,19,21,29,37$ |
| Classical | $6,7,18,22,24,30,31,32$ |
| Complex | $9,20,23,25,26,27,28,33,34,35,36,39$ |

This categorization includes folk and jazz items in classical, pop, or complex, as seemed appropriate from the signal content. In general, signals with more than one kind of source were considered for the complex category. We note that there are only 3 pure speech signals, so we have provided only 1 rather than the suggested 2 speech training signals.

## Selection Process for Test A

After this categorization, we went through all members of each category for test A, the 6-8 $\mathrm{kb} / \mathrm{s}$ test. We rated the members inside each category as to their "critical" behavior on an informal 1-5 scale ( 5 being critical), and selected the critical and typical items based on this rating, with further listening to ensure even distribution. One critical item that was not selected as the critical item in the test was selected for the training item. We found that artifacts, while similar among different categories, were different enough that we believe that one training sequence is appropriate for each category.

For Test A, we also note that the performance of codec 3 is very bad, and that the inclusion of this codec is likely to substantially compress the comparison scale for codecs 1 and 2 . We suggest that if at all possible, codec 3 either be removed from the test, or evaluated by itself in a different test, so as to avoid unfortunate anchoring effects.

For Test A, we have selected the following materials for the test and the training sequence:

| Category | Critical Signal | Typical Signal | Training Signal |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 01 | 38 | 13 |
| Single Instrument | 11 | 16 | 03 |
| Pop | 15 | 08 | 37 |
| Classical | 07 | 31 | 18 |
| Complex | 39 | 33 | 34 |

Item 12 (Glockenspiel) was removed from the list of items, since the bandwidth limitation of codecs 1 and 2 basically lead to a 'broken' signal (higher tones are completely missing). Having this item in the test is assumed not to give reasonable results on the coding quality of the codecs.

## Selection Process for Test B

We repeated the same process for Test $B$, the $16 \mathrm{~kb} / \mathrm{s}$ mono material. We did not find a codec that was particularly bad in this test, and do not suggest exclusion of any codecs. The results were:

| Category | Critical Signal | Typical Signal | Training Signal |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 13 | 01 | 38 |
| Single Instrument | 05 | 11 | 04 |
| Pop | 15 | 29 | 14 |
| Classical | 22 | 18 | 07 |
| Complex | 34 | 09 | 20 |

We note that in this test, the restriction placed on material by "category" forced us to use signals that may penalize one coder more than another, as different signals show each of the three coders to the most disadvantage. We have attempted to balance this as much as possible.

## Selection Process for Test C, Monophonic Signals

Again, we used the same process for selection of signals for the Monophonic part of Test C.
The results are:

| Category | Critical Signal | Typical Signal | Training Signal |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 13 | 38 | 01 |
| Single Instrument | 03 | 16 | 11 |
| Pop | 14 | 19 | 15 |
| Classical | 07 | 22 | 18 |
| Complex | 33 | 28 | 35 |

In this test we note that, other than bandwidth differences, the impairments are not as strikingly different as they were in Tests A and B.

## Selection Process for Test D, Stereophonic Signals

We note that there are an excessive number of codecs to evaluate in parallel for the preselection task. Again, we used the same process, but with all 4 listeners sitting on centerline, and the results are:

| Category | Critical Signal | Typical Signal | Training Signal |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Speech | 13 | 01 | 38 |
| Single Instrument | 11 | 02 | 12 |
| Pop | 10 | 37 | 29 |
| Classical | 18 | 31 | 07 |
| Complex | 20 | 33 | 34 |

In test D we are concerned that the reference be of sufficient quality to convey the original signal imaging and soundstage as well as signal timbre for a suitable anchor. In particular, the reference should be an upper anchor, and we are concerned that it will not fulfill this role. We
must note that in the loudspeaker tests, very large differences in soundstage and image contributed substantially to the impairments caused by the various codecs.

## Some Concerns with the test plan

In section 3.1 and 3.2 of the test plan, the codecs under test, and the codecs to be used as reference are unclear. Above the table in 3.2, it says that the reference transmission bitrates are $28.8,33.6$, and $64 \mathrm{~kb} / \mathrm{s}$. In the table, it shows Layer 3 operating at $8,24,40$ and $56 \mathrm{~kb} / \mathrm{s}$, and G722 operating at $48 \mathrm{~kb} / \mathrm{s}$. While it is possible that these are test conditions, it is difficult from our position to evaluate the suitability and difference from the intended reference signals. Furthermore, we note that none of the coded signals in Test A or Test B are suitable for a reference, and that the signals of Test C and Test D contain perhaps one signal each that is suitable as a reference signal. As we do not know the identities of the codecs yet, it is hard to know if a reference is included, and if this reference is indeed suitable. We suggest substantial care in the use of references, especially in the stereo test.

## Comments on Test Materials

Items vary in length (coded vs. uncoded and coded vs. coded) by up to 1 second in length.
Items should fade without clicks or artifacts. Signals 30, 32, and 34 have audible artifacts at the end of the sample.

Both intersignal loudness and intercodec loudness vary substantially. We wonder if this should be normalized to avoid level biasing. If it is possible, a loudness (NOT INTENSITY!) alignment would be desirable

### 10.6 Annex 6: Instructions for scoring and voting sheets

## How to perform the listening test

## 1. Familiarisation or Training phase

The purpose of the training phase is to allow you, as a listener, to identify and become familiar with distortions and artefacts produced by the systems under test. The sound excerpts in the training phase are selected to illustrate the whole range of qualities that may be heard. This fact does NOT necessarily mean that you should give grade 1.0 to the sound excerpt with lowest quality, nor grade 5.0 to the sound excerpt with highest quality. You should use the range you find appropriate. During the training phase you will also become familiar with the test procedure. After the training, you should know what to listen for and how to grade the quality of the excerpts, and will then proceed with the real test.

During the training phase, you will hear both the reference (original), A, and the processed versions, B, of each item of audio material, presented in the sequence A-B-A-B. Announcements on the screen will remind you whether you are going to listen to the reference $(A)$ or to the processed version (B). The duration of the audio sequences will typically be between 15 and 25 seconds.

You should use the quality scale as follows

| 5.0 | Excellent |
| :--- | :--- |
| 4.0 | Good |
| 3.0 | Fair |
| 2.0 | Poor |
| 1.0 | Bad |

You are advised to use the reference (A) stimulus as an indication of the optimum quality for each programme item, i.e. it corresponds to "Excellent". The grading scale is continuous from 5.0 to 1.0 , and you should give your answer to an accuracy of one decimal place e.g. 3.2, 1.9.

Whilst you should be considering during the training phase how you, as an individual, will interpret the audible impairments in terms of the grading scale, it is important that you should not discuss this personal interpretation with the other subjects at any time.

All grades given during the training phase will be disregarded.

## 2. Grading phase

The purpose of the test is to grade the quality of the audio material you will hear.
For each item, you will listen to two versions of a given audio excerpt. The versions will be identified as A - the reference and B - the processed version, and will be presented in the sequence A-B-A-B. Afterwards there will be 8 seconds of silence during which you write down your judgement of the quality level of B. If you like, you can write down a comment as well, indicating, perhaps, why you gave the grade you did. After this silent period the next item starts with an aural announcement indicating the number of the new item: "item nn". Each session will contain approximately 15 items to be graded.

Test site:
Session $\mathrm{N}^{\circ}$ :


The quality scale

You should grade your evaluations to an accuracy of one decimal place.

| \# item | Grade of B | Comments |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |

### 10.7 Annex 7: List of the "pseudo-randomisation" of each test

test A: 1-30
codec02/item33
codec01/item08
codec02/item07
codec03/item15
codec01/item33
codec01/item31
codec03/item08
codec02/item1 1
codec02/item31
codec02/item38
codec03/item31
codec01/item38
codec02/item16
codec02/item39
codec01/item11
codec01/item39
codec03/item38
codec02/item08
codec03/item01
codec01/item01
codec03/item1 1
codec03/item07
codec02/item01
codec03/item16
codec02/item15
codec03/item39
codec01/item07
codec01/item16
codec01/item15
codec03/item33
test B: 1-30
codec05/item13
codec04/item 22
codec06/item09
codec06/item05
codec06/item29
codec06/item15
codec06/item 22
codec04/item09
codec04/item34
codec05/item18
codec04/item18
codec06/item11
codec04/item11
codec05/item05
codec06/item13
codec06/item34
codec04/item01
codec04/item29
codec05/item 22
codec06/item01
codec05/item01
codec05/item29
codec04/item13
codec05/item34
codec05/item09
codec06/item18
codec04/item05
codec05/item11
codec04/item15
codec05/item15
test C mono: 1-30
codec07/item38
codec08/item 28
codec07/item03
codec08/item13
codec08/item38
codec09/item07
codec08/item16
codec09/item38
codec09/item16
codec07/item13
codec08/item19
codec08/item03
codec08/item 22
codec08/item14
codec09/item14
codec09/item33
codec08/item07
codec09/item03
codec09/item 22
codec07/item19
codec08/item33
codec09/item 28
codec07/item 22
codec09/item13
codec09/item19
codec07/item 28
codec07/item07
codec07/item33
codec07/item14
codec07/item16
test D stereo:1-30
codec 11/item01
codec 12/item33
codec 15/item1 1
codec 10/item02
codec 11/item37
codec 16/item02
codec 16/item37
codec 17/item01
codec 16/item01
codec 11/item02
codec 11/item10
codec 15/item37
codec 13/item01
codec 14/item18
codec 10/item 20
codec 14/item02
codec 10/item1 1
codec 14/item10
codec 11/item33
codec 12/item10
codec 13/item20
codec 11/item31
codec 15/item33
codec 11/item13
codec 17/item18
codec 16/item31
codec 15/item 20
codec 10/item18
codec 16/item13
codec 17/item37
test D stereo:31-60
codec 13/item1 1
codec 17/item10
codec 15/item31
codec 13/item37
codec 14/item20
codec 17/item1 1
codec 14/item37
codec 16/item20
codec 10/item37
codec 16/item10
codec 13/item18
codec 15/item18
codec 14/item1 1
codec 13/item10
codec 12/item31
codec 12/item13
codec 12/item37
codec 10/item31
codec 17/item31
codec 17/item13
codec 12/item1 1
codec 16/item11
codec 17/item20
codec 10/item10
codec 11/item20
codec 12/item18
codec 17/item02
codec 14/item33
codec 17/item33
codec 11/item18
test D stereo:61-80
codec 11/item11
codec 15/item10
codec 14/item01
codec 10/item13
codec 14/item13
codec 15/item02
codec 15/item01
codec 16/item33
codec 15/item13
codec 10/item33
codec 12/item01
codec 16/item18
codec 12/item20
codec 14/item31
codec 13/item02
codec 10/item01
codec 13/item13
codec 13/item31
codec 12/item02
codec 13/item33

### 10.8 Annex 8. Tables from the statistical analysis

Table 1. Subject reliability test: subject-by-subject one-way ANOVA comparing codec responses. For each subject, an ANOVA was run for each test comparing the mean values given to each codec. Four subjects could not make significant comparisons (at the $p<.05$ level) among codecs on half or more of the tests in which they participated. They are highlighted and were removed from the data set.


|  | B | Total | 13.230 | 29 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 5.961 | 2 | 2.980 | 5.861 | . 008 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 13.729 | 27 | . 508 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 19.690 | 29 |  |  |  |
| A9 | A | B/w Groups | 8.067E-02 | 2 | 4.033E-02 | 13 | . 380 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | A. 086 | 27 | 4.022E-02 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | A. 167 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | A. 718 | 2 | . 859 | 5.031 | . 014 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 4.610 | 27 | . 171 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 6.328 | 29 |  |  |  |
| M1 | A | B/w Groups | A. 867 | 2 | . 933 | A. 042 | . 366 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 24.175 | 27 | . 895 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 26.042 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | 7.638 | 2 | 3.819 | 3.591 | . 041 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 28.717 | 27 | A. 064 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 36.355 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | A. 123 | 2 | . 561 | A. 029 | . 371 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 14.727 | 27 | . 545 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 15.850 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 6.713 | 7 | . 959 | 2.354 | . 032 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 29.337 | 72 | . 407 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 36.050 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M2 | A | B/w Groups | 2.826 | 2 | A. 413 | 5.110 | . 013 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 7.466 | 27 | . 277 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 10.292 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | 16.226 | 2 | 8.113 | 5.012 | . 014 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 43.706 | 27 | A. 619 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 59.932 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 3.746 | 2 | A. 873 | 2.798 | . 079 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 18.077 | 27 | . 670 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 21.823 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 73.374 | 7 | 10.482 | 21.310 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 35.415 | 72 | . 492 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 108.789 | 79 |  |  |  |
| m3 | A | B/w Groups | 2.625 | 2 | A. 312 | 4.956 | . 015 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 7.150 | 27 | . 265 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 9.775 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | 12.413 | 2 | 6.206 | 10.642 | . 000 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 15.746 | 27 | . 583 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 28.159 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | A. 323 | 2 | . 661 | 3.216 | . 056 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 5.552 | 27 | . 206 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 6.875 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 8.817 | 7 | A. 260 | 5.718 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 15.862 | 72 | . 220 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 24.679 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M4 | A | B/w Groups | 3.517 | 2 | A. 758 | 2.605 | . 092 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 18.225 | 27 | . 675 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 21.742 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | 22.685 | 2 | 11.342 | 7.515 | . 003 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 40.750 | 27 | A. 509 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 63.435 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | . 806 | 2 | . 403 | . 870 | . 430 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 12.502 | 27 | . 463 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 13.308 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 25.576 | 7 | 3.654 | 4.370 | . 000 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 60.192 | 72 | . 836 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 85.768 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M5 | A | B/w Groups | A. 267 | 2 | . 633 | . 818 | . 452 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 20.900 | 27 | . 774 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 22.167 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | A. 178 | 2 | . 589 | A. 849 | . 177 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 8.602 | 27 | . 319 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 9.780 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 3.333 | 2 | A. 666 | 6.496 | . 005 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 6.926 | 27 | . 257 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 10.259 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 4.350 | 7 | . 621 | A. 556 | . 162 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 28.748 | 72 | . 399 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 33.098 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M6 | A | B/w Groups | 4.317 | 2 | 2.158 | 3.608 | . 041 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 16.150 | 27 | . 598 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 20.467 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | . 648 | 2 | . 324 | A. 036 | . 368 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 8.440 | 27 | . 313 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 9.088 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 34.400 | 2 | 17.200 | 28.491 | . 000 |
|  |  | w/in Groups | 16.300 | 27 | . 604 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 50.700 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 88.179 | 7 | 12.597 | 17.361 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 52.243 | 72 | . 726 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 140.422 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M7 | A | B/w Groups | . 117 | 2 | 5.833E-02 | . 257 | . 775 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 6.125 | 27 | . 227 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 6.242 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | 7.203 | 2 | 3.601 | 8.891 | . 001 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 10.936 | 27 | . 405 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 18.139 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 2.493 | 2 | A. 246 | 3.894 | . 033 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 8.642 | 27 | . 320 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 11.135 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | . 622 | 7 | 8.884E-02 | . 885 | . 523 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 7.225 | 72 | . 100 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 7.847 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M8 | A | B/w Groups | A. 069 | 2 | . 534 | 3.278 | . 053 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 4.401 | 27 | . 163 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 5.470 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | B | B/w Groups | . 186 | 2 | 9.300E-02 | . 375 | . 691 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 6.694 | 27 | . 248 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 6.880 | 29 |  |  |  |


|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 8.867E-02 | 2 | 4.433E-02 | 518 | . 602 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 2.313 | 27 | $8.567 \mathrm{E}-02$ |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 2.402 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | . 242 | 7 | $3.450 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 858 | . 544 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 2.894 | 72 | 4.019E-02 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 3.136 | 79 |  |  |  |
| M9 | 3 | B/w Groups | A. 133 | 2 | . 566 | A. 929 | . 165 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 7.926 | 27 | . 294 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 9.059 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 21.171 | 7 | 3.024 | 6.749 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 32.264 | 72 | . 448 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 53.435 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N1 | 3 | B/w Groups | 2.067 | 2 | A. 033 | A. 037 | . 368 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 26.900 | 27 | . 996 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 28.967 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 53.600 | 7 | 7.657 | 11.438 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 48.200 | 72 | . 669 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 101.800 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N10 | 3 | B/w Groups | 10.400 | 2 | 5.200 | 4.875 | . 016 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 28.800 | 27 | A. 067 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 39.200 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 82.887 | 7 | 11.841 | 21.051 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 40.500 | 72 | . 563 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 123.387 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N11 | 3 | B/w Groups | A. 267 | 2 | . 633 | . 479 | . 625 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 35.700 | 27 | A. 322 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 36.967 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 23.750 | 7 | 3.393 | 2.283 | . 037 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 1070 | 72 | A. 486 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 130.750 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N12 | 3 | B/w Groups | 4.467 | 2 | 2.233 | A. 530 | . 235 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 39.400 | 27 | A. 459 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 43.867 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 64.388 | 7 | 9.198 | 10.665 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 62.100 | 72 | . 863 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 126.488 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N13 | 3 | B/w Groups | 8.867 | 2 | 4.433 | 3.861 | . 034 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 310 | 27 | A. 148 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 39.867 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 112.388 | 7 | 16.055 | 17.126 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 67.500 | 72 | . 937 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 179.888 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N14 | 3 | B/w Groups | 8.267 | 2 | 4.133 | 3.532 | . 043 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 31.600 | 27 | A. 170 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 39.867 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 61.200 | 7 | 8.743 | 13.989 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 450 | 72 | . 625 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 106.200 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N15 | 3 | B/w Groups | 4.467 | 2 | 2.233 | A. 194 | . 318 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 50.500 | 27 | A. 870 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 54.967 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 101.150 | 7 | 14.450 | 25.752 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 40.400 | 72 | . 561 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 141.550 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N16 | 3 | B/w Groups | 10.067 | 2 | 5.033 | 14.613 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 9.300 | 27 | . 344 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 19.367 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 77.550 | 7 | 11.079 | 17.965 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 44.400 | 72 | . 617 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 121.950 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N2 | 3 | B/w Groups | 5.400 | 2 | 2.700 | 2.661 | . 088 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 27.400 | 27 | A. 015 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 32.800 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 35.987 | 7 | 5.141 | 5.566 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 66.500 | 72 | . 924 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 102.487 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N3 | 3 | B/w Groups | A. 267 | 2 | . 633 | . 500 | . 612 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 34.200 | 27 | A. 267 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 35.467 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 60.150 | 7 | 8.593 | 9.403 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 65.800 | 72 | . 914 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 125.950 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N4 | 3 | B/w Groups | 6.867 | 2 | 3.433 | 4.522 | . 020 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 20.500 | 27 | . 759 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 27.367 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 44.200 | 7 | 6.314 | 10.332 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 440 | 72 | . 611 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 88.200 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N5 | 3 | B/w Groups | 5.067 | 2 | 2.533 | A. 541 | . 233 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 44.400 | 27 | A. 644 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 49.467 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 580 | 7 | 8.286 | 5.233 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 1140 | 72 | A. 583 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 1720 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N6 | 3 | B/w Groups | 6.867 | 2 | 3.433 | 7.357 | . 003 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 12.600 | 27 | . 467 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 19.467 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 50.987 | 7 | 7.284 | 12.577 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 41.700 | 72 | . 579 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 92.687 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N7 | 3 | B/w Groups | 7.267 | 2 | 3.633 | 4.419 | . 022 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 22.200 | 27 | . 822 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 29.467 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 84.988 | 7 | 12.141 | 14.594 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 59.900 | 72 | . 832 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 144.888 | 79 |  |  |  |
| N8 | 3 | B/w Groups | 5.267 | 2 | 2.633 | 2.890 | . 073 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 24.600 | 27 | . 911 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 29.867 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 80.987 | 7 | 11.570 | 16.175 | . 000 |



| SC1 | B | Total | 30.700 | 29 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 18.067 | 2 | 9.033 | 8.324 | . 002 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 29.300 | 27 | A. 085 | 11.406 | . 000 |
|  | 3 | Total | 47.367 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 26.867 | 2 | 13.433 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 31.800 | 27 | A. 178 |  |  |
| SC10 | 4 | Total | 58.667 | 29 |  | 28.451 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 163.200 | 7 | 23.314 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 590 | 72 | . 819 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 222.200 | 79 |  | 17.876 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 28.867 | 2 | 14.433 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 21.800 | 27 | . 807 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 50.667 | 29 |  | 20.309 |  |
| SC11 |  | B/w Groups | 1240 | 7 | 17.714 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 62.800 | 72 | . 872 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 186.800 | 79 |  | 4.851 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 15.200 | 2 | 7.600 |  | . 016 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 42.300 | 27 | A. 567 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 57.500 | 29 |  | 10.678 |  |
| SC12 |  | B/w Groups | 75.888 | 7 | 10.841 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 73.100 | 72 | A. 015 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 148.988 | 79 |  | 12.436 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 22.200 | 2 | 11.100 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 24.100 | 27 | . 893 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 46.300 | 29 |  | 11.418 |  |
| SC13 |  | B/w Groups | 83.588 | 7 | 11.941 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 75.300 | 72 | A. 046 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 158.888 | 79 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 10.400 | 2 | 5.200 | 5.032 | . 014 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 27.900 | 27 | A. 033 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 38.300 | 29 |  |  |  |
| SC14 |  | B/w Groups | 76.400 | 7 | 10.914 | 14.883 | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 52.800 | 72 | . 733 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 129.200 | 79 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 50 | 2 | 2.500 | A. 696 | . 202 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 39.800 | 27 | A. 474 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 44.800 | 29 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 48.600 | 7 | 6.943 | 4.487 | . 000 |
| SC15 |  | W/in Groups | 111.400 | 72 | A. 547 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 1600 | 79 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | A. 400 | 2 | . 700 | . 690 | . 510 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 27.400 | 27 | A. 015 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 28.800 | 29 |  | 6.746 | . 000 |
| SC16 |  | B/w Groups | 29.188 | 7 | 4.170 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 44.500 | 72 | . 618 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 73.688 | 79 |  |  |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 7.467 | 2 | 3.733 | 4.603 | . 019 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 21.900 | 27 | . 811 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 29.367 | 29 |  | 22.877 | . 000 |
| SC2 |  | B/w Groups | 77.400 | 7 | 11.057 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 34.800 | 72 | . 483 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 112.200 | 79 |  | 3.651 | . 040 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 11.467 | 2 | 5.733 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 42.400 | 27 | A. 570 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 53.867 | 29 |  | 21.541 | . 000 |
| SC3 |  | B/w Groups | 127.750 | 7 | 18.250 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 610 | 72 | . 847 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 188.750 | 79 |  | 9.145 | . 001 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 12.600 | 2 | 6.300 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 18.600 | 27 | . 689 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 31.200 | 29 |  | 20.557 | . 000 |
| SC4 |  | B/w Groups | 71.950 | 7 | 10.279 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 360 | 72 | . 500 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 107.950 | 79 |  | 3.100 | . 061 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 6.200 | 2 | 3.100 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 270 | 27 | 10 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 33.200 | 29 |  | 6.458 | . 000 |
| SC5 |  | B/w Groups | 270 | 7 | 3.857 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 430 | 72 | . 597 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 700 | 79 |  | 3.551 | . 043 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 4.867 | 2 | 2.433 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 18.500 | 27 | . 685 |  |  |
| SC6 | 4 | Total | 23.367 | 29 |  | 11.718 | . 000 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 35.888 | 7 | 5.127 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 31.500 | 72 | . 438 |  |  |
|  | 3 | Total | 67.388 | 79 |  | 5.499 | . 010 |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 14.867 | 2 | 7.433 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 36.500 | 27 | A. 352 |  |  |
| SC7 | 4 | Total | 51.367 | 29 |  | 23.468 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 109.287 | 7 | 15.612 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 47.900 | 72 | . 665 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 157.187 | 79 |  | 2.901 |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 2.600 | 2 | A. 300 |  | . 072 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 12.100 | 27 | . 448 |  |  |
| SC8 |  | Total | 14.700 | 29 |  | 9.022 |  |
|  | 4 | B/w Groups | 20.350 | 7 | 2.907 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 23.200 | 72 | . 322 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 43.550 | 79 |  | 8.242 |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 10.867 | 2 | 5.433 |  | . 002 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 17.800 | 27 | . 659 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 28.667 | 29 |  | 10.413 | . 000 |
| SC9 | 4 | B/w Groups | 31.687 | 7 | 4.527 |  |  |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 31.300 | 72 | . 435 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 62.987 | 79 |  | 5.295 |  |
|  | 3 | B/w Groups | 18.867 | 2 | 9.433 |  | . 011 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 48.100 | 27 | A. 781 |  |  |
|  | 4 | Total | 66.967 | 29 |  | 13.080 |  |
|  |  | B/w Groups | 77.188 |  | 11.027 |  | . 000 |
|  |  | W/in Groups | 60.700 | 72 | . 843 |  |  |
|  |  | Total | 137.888 | 79 |  |  |  |

Table 2: Comparison of results among sites. The Dunnett post-hoc test for a significant ANOVA showing differences in score between sites.

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| TEST | (I) SITENUM | (J) SITENUM | Mean Difference$(I-J)$ | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | 1.00 | 2.00 | . $3504{ }^{*}$ | . 075 | . 000 | . 1812 | . 5197 |
|  |  | 4.00 | . 3750 * | . 061 | . 000 | . 2269 | . 5231 |
|  | 2.00 | 1.00 | -.3504* | . 075 | . 000 | -. 5197 | -. 1812 |
|  |  | 4.00 | $2.458 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 075 | . 984 | -. 1578 | . 2069 |
|  | 4.00 | 1.00 | -.3750* | . 061 | . 000 | -. 5231 | -. 2269 |
|  |  | 2.00 | -2.46E-02 | . 075 | . 984 | -. 2069 | . 1578 |
| 2.00 | 1.00 | 2.00 | . $3946{ }^{*}$ | . 090 | . 000 | . 1997 | . 5895 |
|  |  | 4.00 | . $3587 *$ | . 073 | . 000 | . 1799 | . 5376 |
|  | 2.00 | 1.00 | -.3946* | . 090 | . 000 | -. 5895 | -. 1997 |
|  |  | 4.00 | -3.58E-02 | . 090 | . 970 | -. 2514 | . 1797 |
|  | 4.00 | 1.00 | -.3587* | . 073 | . 000 | -. 5376 | -. 1799 |
|  |  | 2.00 | 3.583E-02 | . 090 | . 970 | -. 1797 | . 2514 |
| 3.00 | 2.00 | 4.00 | .5798* | . 089 | . 000 | . 3906 | . 7690 |
|  |  | 3.00 | . $5673^{*}$ | . 089 | . 000 | . 3906 | . 7440 |
|  | 4.00 | 2.00 | -.5798* | . 089 | . 000 | -. 7690 | -. 3906 |
|  |  | 3.00 | -1.25E-02 | . 076 | . 998 | -. 2055 | . 1805 |
|  | 3.00 | 2.00 | -.5673* | . 089 | . 000 | -. 7440 | -. 3906 |
|  |  | 4.00 | $1.250 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 076 | . 998 | -. 1805 | . 2055 |
| 4.00 | 2.00 | 4.00 | .5513* | . 059 | . 000 | . 4282 | . 6744 |
|  |  | 3.00 | .4263* | . 059 | . 000 | . 3064 | . 5462 |
|  | 4.00 | 2.00 | -.5513* | . 059 | . 000 | -. 6744 | -. 4282 |
|  |  | 3.00 | -. 1250 | . 050 | . 055 | -. 2521 | $2.125 \mathrm{E}-03$ |
|  | 3.00 | 2.00 | -.4263* | . 059 | . 000 | -. 5462 | -. 3064 |
|  |  | 4.00 | . 1250 | . 050 | . 055 | -2.13E-03 | . 2521 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 3. Test A, Site 1 results. All results tables are Dunnett post-hoc analyses of significant ANOVAs comparing scores across codecs. For ,item-by-item" comparisons, the results are broken down separately by item. Significant differences are marked with (*); for mean differences in the positive (+) direction, the (I) codec is superior; for mean differences in the negative (-) direction, the $(\mathrm{J})$ codec is superior.

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| TEST | ( I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 1033 | . 085 | . 540 | -. 3090 | . 1023 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .7073* | . 085 | . 000 | . 4998 | . 9149 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 1033 | . 085 | . 540 | -. 1023 | . 3090 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .8107* | . 085 | . 000 | . 6143 | 1.0070 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -.7073* | . 085 | . 000 | -. 9149 | -. 4998 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.8107* | . 085 | . 000 | -1.0070 | -. 6143 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 4. Test A, Site $2 \& 4$ results.

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| (I) CODEC | (J)CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 1886 | . 093 | . 155 | -. 4231 | $4.596 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | HILN 6 | .7243* | . 093 | . 000 | . 5137 | . 9349 |
| MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 1886 | . 093 | . 155 | -4.60E-02 | . 4231 |
|  | HILN 6 | .9129* | . 093 | . 000 | . 6927 | 1.1330 |
| HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -.7243* | . 093 | . 000 | -. 9349 | -. 5137 |
|  | MP3 8 | -.9129* | . 093 | . 000 | -1.1330 | -. 6927 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 5. Test A, Site 1 item-by-item comparison

Dependent Variable: SCORE

| ITEM | (1) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 1867 | . 216 | . 789 | -. 7547 | . 3814 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 2133 | . 216 | . 716 | -. 3552 | . 7819 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 1867 | . 216 | . 789 | -. 3814 | . 7547 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 4000 | . 216 | . 154 | -. 1064 | . 9064 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 2133 | . 216 | . 716 | -. 7819 | . 3552 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -. 4000 | . 216 | . 154 | -. 9064 | . 1064 |
| 7.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | $9.333 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 184 | . 927 | -. 3383 | . 5250 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.3400* | . 184 | . 000 | . 8657 | 1.8143 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -9.33E-02 | . 184 | . 927 | -. 5250 | . 3383 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.2467* | . 184 | . 000 | . 7503 | 1.7431 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.3400* | . 184 | . 000 | -1.8143 | -. 8657 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.2467* | . 184 | . 000 | -1.7431 | -. 7503 |
| 8.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | . 2133 | . 222 | . 682 | -. 3244 | . 7511 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.1733* | . 222 | . 000 | . 5889 | 1.7578 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 2133 | . 222 | . 682 | -. 7511 | . 3244 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .9600* | . 222 | . 001 | . 3924 | 1.5276 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.1733* | . 222 | . 000 | -1.7578 | -. 5889 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.9600* | . 222 | . 001 | -1.5276 | -. 3924 |
| 11.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | . 1200 | . 229 | . 928 | -. 4360 | . 6760 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.4800* | . 229 | . 000 | . 8868 | 2.0732 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 1200 | . 229 | . 928 | -. 6760 | . 4360 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.3600* | . 229 | . 000 | . 7739 | 1.9461 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.4800* | . 229 | . 000 | -2.0732 | -. 8868 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.3600* | . 229 | . 000 | -1.9461 | -. 7739 |
| 15.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -4.67E-02 | . 243 | . 995 | -. 6054 | . 5121 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 2467 | . 243 | . 740 | -. 4367 | . 9300 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | 4.667E-02 | . 243 | . 995 | -. 5121 | . 6054 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 2933 | . 243 | . 531 | -. 3154 | . 9021 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 2467 | . 243 | . 740 | -. 9300 | . 4367 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -. 2933 | . 243 | . 531 | -. 9021 | . 3154 |
| 16.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 2333 | . 219 | . 567 | -. 7379 | . 2713 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | -8.00E-02 | . 219 | . 974 | -. 6251 | . 4651 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 2333 | . 219 | . 567 | -. 2713 | . 7379 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 1533 | . 219 | . 894 | -. 4630 | . 7696 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | 8.000E-02 | . 219 | . 974 | -. 4651 | . 6251 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -. 1533 | . 219 | . 894 | -. 7696 | . 4630 |
| 31.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -8.67E-02 | . 214 | . 959 | -. 5806 | . 4073 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .6000* | . 214 | . 030 | $4.866 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.1513 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | 8.667E-02 | . 214 | . 959 | -. 4073 | . 5806 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .6867* | . 214 | . 018 | . 1012 | 1.2721 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -.6000* | . 214 | . 030 | -1.1513 | -4.87E-02 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.6867* | . 214 | . 018 | -1.2721 | -. 1012 |
| 33.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -.5200* | . 161 | . 004 | -. 8925 | -. 1475 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 3000 | . 161 | . 255 | -. 1413 | . 7413 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | .5200* | . 161 | . 004 | . 1475 | . 8925 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .8200* | . 161 | . 000 | . 4116 | 1.2284 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 3000 | . 161 | . 255 | -. 7413 | . 1413 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.8200* | . 161 | . 000 | -1.2284 | -. 4116 |
| 38.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -1.00E-01 | . 207 | . 951 | -. 6361 | . 4361 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 2533 | . 207 | . 549 | -. 2792 | . 7858 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | $1.000 \mathrm{E}-01$ | . 207 | . 951 | -. 4361 | . 6361 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 3533 | . 207 | . 238 | -. 1539 | . 8606 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 2533 | . 207 | . 549 | -. 7858 | . 2792 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -. 3533 | . 207 | . 238 | -. 8606 | . 1539 |
| 39.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 2867 | . 262 | . 634 | -. 9607 | . 3874 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.5467* | . 262 | . 000 | . 9010 | 2.1923 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 2867 | . 262 | . 634 | -. 3874 | . 9607 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.8333* | . 262 | . 000 | 1.1633 | 2.5034 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.5467* | . 262 | . 000 | -2.1923 | -. 9010 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.8333* | . 262 | . 000 | -2.5034 | -1.1633 |

[^1]Table 6: Test A, Site $2 \& 4$ item-by-item comparison

| Multiple Comparisons |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dependent Variable: SCORE Dunnett T3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ITEM |  |  | Mean |  |  | $\begin{array}{r} 95 \% \text { Co } \\ \text { Inte } \\ \hline \end{array}$ | fidence <br> val |
|  | (1) CODEC | (J) <br> CODEC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Difference } \\ (1-J) \end{gathered}$ | Std. Error | Sig. | Lower <br> Bound | Upper <br> Bound |
|  | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 2381 | . 229 | . 732 | -. 8775 | . 4013 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 3810 | . 229 | . 189 | -. 1264 | . 8883 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 2381 | . 229 | . 732 | -. 4013 | . 8775 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .6190* | . 229 | . 029 | $5.254 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.1856 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 3810 | . 229 | . 189 | -. 8883 | . 1264 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.6190* | . 229 | . 029 | -1.1856 | -5.25E-02 |
| 7.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | . 4476 | . 263 | . 344 | -. 2792 | 1.1744 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.4143* | . 263 | . 000 | . 7942 | 2.0343 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 4476 | . 263 | . 344 | -1.1744 | . 2792 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .9667* | . 263 | . 001 | . 3484 | 1.5849 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.4143* | . 263 | . 000 | -2.0343 | -. 7942 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.9667* | . 263 | . 001 | -1.5849 | -. 3484 |
| 8.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | . 1667 | . 218 | . 839 | -. 3938 | . 7271 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.2571* | . 218 | . 000 | . 6724 | 1.8419 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 1667 | . 218 | . 839 | -. 7271 | . 3938 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.0905* | . 218 | . 000 | . 6109 | 1.5701 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.2571* | . 218 | . 000 | -1.8419 | -. 6724 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.0905* | . 218 | . 000 | -1.5701 | -. 6109 |
| 11.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 1238 | . 271 | . 961 | -. 8279 | . 5803 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.4381* | . 271 | . 000 | . 8242 | 2.0520 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 1238 | . 271 | . 961 | -. 5803 | . 8279 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.5619* | . 271 | . 000 | . 8561 | 2.2677 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.4381* | . 271 | . 000 | -2.0520 | -. 8242 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.5619* | . 271 | . 000 | -2.2677 | -. 8561 |
| 15.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 5095 | . 258 | . 127 | -1.1221 | . 1031 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 1762 | . 258 | . 867 | -. 4601 | . 8125 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 5095 | . 258 | . 127 | -. 1031 | 1.1221 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .6857* | . 258 | . 047 | 5.933E-03 | 1.3655 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 1762 | . 258 | . 867 | -.8125 | . 4601 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.6857* | . 258 | . 047 | -1.3655 | -5.93E-03 |
| 16.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 1810 | . 249 | . 832 | -. 7804 | . 4185 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 1048 | . 249 | . 955 | -. 4645 | . 6741 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 1810 | . 249 | . 832 | -. 4185 | . 7804 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 2857 | . 249 | . 667 | -. 4076 | . 9790 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 1048 | . 249 | . 955 | -. 6741 | . 4645 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -. 2857 | . 249 | . 667 | -. 9790 | . 4076 |
| 31.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 2857 | . 294 | . 706 | -1.0207 | . 4493 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.0524* | . 294 | . 003 | . 3041 | 1.8006 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 2857 | . 294 | . 706 | -. 4493 | 1.0207 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.3381* | . 294 | . 000 | . 6245 | 2.0517 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.0524* | . 294 | . 003 | -1.8006 | -. 3041 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -1.3381* | . 294 | . 000 | -2.0517 | -. 6245 |
| 33.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -.5952* | . 224 | . 049 | -1.1886 | -1.84E-03 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | . 1952 | . 224 | . 682 | -. 2889 | . 6794 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | .5952* | . 224 | . 049 | $1.841 \mathrm{E}-03$ | 1.1886 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | .7905* | . 224 | . 006 | . 1966 | 1.3843 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -. 1952 | . 224 | . 682 | -. 6794 | . 2889 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -.7905* | . 224 | . 006 | -1.3843 | -. 1966 |
| 38.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | 6.667E-02 | . 215 | . 977 | -. 3890 | . 5224 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | -. 2952 | . 215 | . 523 | -. 8888 | . 2983 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | -6.67E-02 | . 215 | . 977 | -. 5224 | . 3890 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | -. 3619 | . 215 | . 287 | -. 9130 | . 1892 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | . 2952 | . 215 | . 523 | -. 2983 | . 8888 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | . 3619 | . 215 | . 287 | -. 1892 | . 9130 |
| 39.00 | TwinVQ 6 | MP3 8 | -. 6333 | . 318 | . 189 | -1.4745 | . 2078 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 1.5190* | . 318 | . 000 | . 7437 | 2.2943 |
|  | MP3 8 | TwinVQ 6 | . 6333 | . 318 | . 189 | -. 2078 | 1.4745 |
|  |  | HILN 6 | 2.1524* | . 318 | . 000 | 1.3941 | 2.9106 |
|  | HILN 6 | TwinVQ 6 | -1.5190* | . 318 | . 000 | -2.2943 | -. 7437 |
|  |  | MP3 8 | -2.1524* | . 318 | . 000 | -2.9106 | -1.3941 |

[^2]Table 7. Test B, Site 1 overall results

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper <br> Bound |
| AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .5860* | . 098 | . 000 | . 3374 | . 8346 |
|  | G722 48 | -.6120* | . 098 | . 000 | -. 8103 | -. 4137 |
| HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.5860* | . 098 | . 000 | -. 8346 | -. 3374 |
|  | G722 48 | -1.1980* | . 098 | . 000 | -1.4500 | -. 9460 |
| G722 48 | AAC 16 | .6120* | . 098 | . 000 | . 4137 | . 8103 |
|  | HILN 16 | 1.1980* | . 098 | . 000 | . 9460 | 1.4500 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 8. Test B, Site $2 \& 4$ overall results

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .8414* | . 108 | . 000 | . 5735 | 1.1094 |
|  | G722 48 | -.6600* | . 108 | . 000 | -. 9047 | -. 4153 |
| HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.8414* | . 108 | . 000 | -1.1094 | -. 5735 |
|  | G722 48 | -1.5014* | . 108 | . 000 | -1.7641 | -1.2388 |
| G722 48 | AAC 16 | .6600* | . 108 | . 000 | . 4153 | . 9047 |
|  | HILN 16 | 1.5014* | . 108 | . 000 | 1.2388 | 1.7641 |

${ }^{*}$. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 9. Test B, Site 1 item-by-item breakdown

Multiple Comparisons
Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

| ITEM | (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .7333* | . 214 | . 010 | . 1558 | 1.3108 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.5867* | . 214 | . 000 | -2.1020 | -1.0713 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.7333* | . 214 | . 010 | -1.3108 | -. 1558 |
|  |  | G722 48 | $-2.3200 *$ | . 214 | . 000 | -2.8528 | -1.7872 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | $1.5867^{*}$ | . 214 | . 000 | 1.0713 | 2.1020 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | $2.3200^{*}$ | . 214 | . 000 | 1.7872 | 2.8528 |
| 5.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | 1.333E-02 | . 229 | 1.000 | -. 5137 | . 5404 |
|  |  | G722 48 | .7267* | . 229 | . 017 | . 1139 | 1.3395 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.33E-02 | . 229 | 1.000 | -. 5404 | . 5137 |
|  |  | G722 48 | .7133* | . 229 | . 017 | . 1115 | 1.3152 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | -.7267* | . 229 | . 017 | -1.3395 | -. 1139 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | -.7133* | . 229 | . 017 | -1.3152 | -. 1115 |
| 9.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . 6733 | . 262 | . 052 | -4.66E-03 | 1.3513 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 1067 | . 262 | . 957 | -. 7071 | . 4938 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -. 6733 | . 262 | . 052 | -1.3513 | $4.660 \mathrm{E}-03$ |
|  |  | G722 48 | -.7800* | . 262 | . 028 | -1.4903 | -6.97E-02 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | . 1067 | . 262 | . 957 | -. 4938 | . 7071 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | .7800* | . 262 | . 028 | $6.973 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.4903 |
| 11.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . 5733 | . 259 | . 126 | -. 1179 | 1.2646 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 5667 | . 259 | . 081 | -1.1874 | $5.409 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -. 5733 | . 259 | . 126 | -1.2646 | . 1179 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.1400* | . 259 | . 000 | -1.7973 | -. 4827 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | . 5667 | . 259 | . 081 | -5.41E-02 | 1.1874 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | $1.1400^{*}$ | . 259 | . 000 | . 4827 | 1.7973 |
| 13.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . $9533 *$ | . 200 | . 000 | . 5021 | 1.4045 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -.8467* | . 200 | . 002 | -1.3999 | -. 2935 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.9533* | . 200 | . 000 | -1.4045 | -. 5021 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.8000* | . 200 | . 000 | -2.3173 | -1.2827 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | .8467* | . 200 | . 002 | . 2935 | 1.3999 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 1.8000* | . 200 | . 000 | 1.2827 | 2.3173 |
| 15.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .7533* | . 212 | . 006 | . 1937 | 1.3130 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.2667* | . 212 | . 000 | -1.7843 | -. 7491 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.7533* | . 212 | . 006 | -1.3130 | -. 1937 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.0200* | . 212 | . 000 | -2.5502 | -1.4898 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | 1.2667* | . 212 | . 000 | . 7491 | 1.7843 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 2.0200* | . 212 | . 000 | 1.4898 | 2.5502 |
| 18.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . 7200 | . 289 | . 077 | -6.07E-02 | 1.5007 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -3.33E-02 | . 289 | . 999 | -. 6664 | . 5998 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -. 7200 | . 289 | . 077 | -1.5007 | 6.067E-02 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 7533 | . 289 | . 061 | -1.5335 | $2.681 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | $3.333 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 289 | . 999 | -. 5998 | . 6664 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | . 7533 | . 289 | . 061 | -2.68E-02 | 1.5335 |
| 22.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | -1.0200* | . 181 | . 000 | -1.4843 | -. 5557 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 2667 | . 181 | . 470 | -. 7760 | . 2427 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | 1.0200* | . 181 | . 000 | . 5557 | 1.4843 |
|  |  | G722 48 | .7533* | . 181 | . 000 | . 3454 | 1.1612 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | . 2667 | . 181 | . 470 | -. 2427 | . 7760 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | -.7533* | . 181 | . 000 | -1.1612 | -. 3454 |
| 29.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | $1.4800^{*}$ | . 173 | . 000 | . 9954 | 1.9646 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -.7200* | . 173 | . 001 | -1.1506 | -. 2894 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.4800* | . 173 | . 000 | -1.9646 | -. 9954 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.2000* | . 173 | . 000 | -2.6019 | -1.7981 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | .7200* | . 173 | . 001 | . 2894 | 1.1506 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | $2.2000^{*}$ | . 173 | . 000 | 1.7981 | 2.6019 |
| 34.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .9800* | . 220 | . 002 | . 3411 | 1.6189 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.4533* | . 220 | . 000 | -1.9446 | -. 9621 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.9800* | . 220 | . 002 | -1.6189 | -. 3411 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.4333* | . 220 | . 000 | -2.9827 | -1.8840 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | 1.4533* | . 220 | . 000 | . 9621 | 1.9446 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 2.4333* | . 220 | . 000 | 1.8840 | 2.9827 |

[^3]Table 10. Test B, site $2 \& 4$ item-by-item comparison

| Multiple Comparisons |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dependent Variable: SCORE Dunnett T3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ITEM | (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . $5762^{*}$ | . 169 | . 004 | . 1639 | . 9885 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.3667* | . 169 | . 000 | -2.7870 | -1.9464 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.5762* | . 169 | . 004 | -. 9885 | -. 1639 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.9429* | . 169 | . 000 | -3.3712 | -2.5145 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | $2.3667^{*}$ | . 169 | . 000 | 1.9464 | 2.7870 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 2.9429* | . 169 | . 000 | 2.5145 | 3.3712 |
| 5.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . 3095 | . 324 | . 733 | -. 5232 | 1.1422 |
|  |  | G722 48 | 1.3524* | . 324 | . 000 | . 5858 | 2.1189 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -. 3095 | . 324 | . 733 | -1.1422 | . 5232 |
|  |  | G722 48 | 1.0429* | . 324 | . 009 | . 2260 | 1.8597 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | -1.3524* | . 324 | . 000 | -2.1189 | -. 5858 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | -1.0429* | . 324 | . 009 | -1.8597 | -. 2260 |
| 9.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | . $9190^{*}$ | . 298 | . 004 | . 2527 | 1.5854 |
|  |  | G722 48 | . 2667 | . 298 | . 781 | -. 5177 | 1.0510 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.9190* | . 298 | . 004 | -1.5854 | -. 2527 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 6524 | . 298 | . 117 | -1.4221 | . 1173 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | -. 2667 | . 298 | . 781 | -1.0510 | . 5177 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | . 6524 | . 298 | . 117 | -. 1173 | 1.4221 |
| 11.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | 1.0905* | . 253 | . 000 | . 5190 | 1.6620 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 3381 | . 253 | . 518 | -1.0130 | . 3368 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.0905* | . 253 | . 000 | -1.6620 | -. 5190 |
|  |  | G722 48 | $-1.4286^{*}$ | . 253 | . 000 | -2.0709 | -. 7862 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | . 3381 | . 253 | . 518 | -. 3368 | 1.0130 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 1.4286* | . 253 | . 000 | . 7862 | 2.0709 |
| 13.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .6905* | . 226 | . 012 | . 1299 | 1.2510 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.0381* | . 226 | . 000 | -1.6517 | -. 4244 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.6905* | . 226 | . 012 | -1.2510 | -. 1299 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.7286* | . 226 | . 000 | -2.2406 | -1.2166 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | 1.0381* | . 226 | . 000 | . 4244 | 1.6517 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 1.7286* | . 226 | . 000 | 1.2166 | 2.2406 |
| 15.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | .9952* | . 239 | . 001 | . 3923 | 1.5982 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.6762* | . 239 | . 000 | -2.3032 | -1.0492 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -.9952* | . 239 | . 001 | -1.5982 | -. 3923 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.6714* | . 239 | . 000 | -3.2260 | -2.1168 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | 1.6762* | . 239 | . 000 | 1.0492 | 2.3032 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | $2.6714^{*}$ | . 239 | . 000 | 2.1168 | 3.2260 |
| 18.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | 1.5048* | . 267 | . 000 | . 7924 | 2.2171 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -. 4762 | . 267 | . 258 | -1.1728 | . 2204 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.5048* | . 267 | . 000 | -2.2171 | -. 7924 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -1.9810* | . 267 | . 000 | -2.5637 | -1.3982 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | . 4762 | . 267 | . 258 | -. 2204 | 1.1728 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 1.9810* | . 267 | . 000 | 1.3982 | 2.5637 |
| 22.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | -. 4571 | . 262 | . 217 | -1.0895 | . 1752 |
|  |  | G722 48 | . 3952 | . 262 | . 382 | -. 2758 | 1.0663 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | . 4571 | . 262 | . 217 | -. 1752 | 1.0895 |
|  |  | G722 48 | .8524* | . 262 | . 007 | . 1981 | 1.5067 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | -. 3952 | . 262 | . 382 | -1.0663 | . 2758 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | -.8524* | . 262 | . 007 | -1.5067 | -. 1981 |
| 29.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | 1.7571* | . 248 | . 000 | 1.1848 | 2.3295 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -.8381* | . 248 | . 009 | -1.4979 | -. 1783 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.7571* | . 248 | . 000 | -2.3295 | -1.1848 |
|  |  | G722 48 | $-2.5952^{*}$ | . 248 | . 000 | -3.2119 | -1.9786 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | .8381* | . 248 | . 009 | . 1783 | 1.4979 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 2.5952* | . 248 | . 000 | 1.9786 | 3.2119 |
| 34.00 | AAC 16 | HILN 16 | 1.0286* | . 209 | . 000 | . 5081 | 1.5491 |
|  |  | G722 48 | $-1.8810^{*}$ | . 209 | . 000 | -2.4666 | -1.2953 |
|  | HILN 16 | AAC 16 | -1.0286* | . 209 | . 000 | -1.5491 | -. 5081 |
|  |  | G722 48 | -2.9095* | . 209 | . 000 | -3.3615 | -2.4576 |
|  | G722 48 | AAC 16 | 1.8810* | . 209 | . 000 | 1.2953 | 2.4666 |
|  |  | HILN 16 | 2.9095* | . 209 | . 000 | 2.4576 | 3.3615 |

[^4]Table 11. Test C, Site $\mathbf{3}$ \& 4 overall comparison

## Multiple Comparisons

Dependent Variable: SCORE
Dunnett T3

|  |  | Mean |  |  | $\begin{array}{r} 95 \% \mathrm{C} \\ \text { Int } \end{array}$ | fidence val |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | $\begin{gathered} \text { Difference } \\ (I-J) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Std. Error | Sig. | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -.8969* | . 091 | . 000 | -1.1129 | -. 6808 |
|  | AAC 24 | -1.1281* | . 091 | . 000 | -1.3500 | -. 9062 |
| AAC 24 scal | MP3 24 | .8969* | . 091 | . 000 | . 6808 | 1.1129 |
|  | AAC 24 | -.2313* | . 091 | . 031 | -. 4465 | -1.60E-02 |
| AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.1281* | . 091 | . 000 | . 9062 | 1.3500 |
|  | AAC 24 scal | .2313* | . 091 | . 031 | $1.597 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 4465 |

${ }^{*}$. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 12. Test D, Site $3 \& 4$ overall comparison

| Multiple Comparisons |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dependent Variable: SCORE Dunnett T3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | Mean Difference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | Lower <br> Bound | Upper Bound |
| MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.2719* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.5352 | -1.0086 |
|  | AAC 40 | -.9125* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.1747 | -. 6503 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -1.4688* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.7245 | -1.2130 |
|  | AAC 56 | -1.9125** | . 081 | . 000 | -2.1529 | -1.6721 |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | -.3937* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 6586 | -. 1289 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.6688* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.9463 | -1.3912 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | .8219* | . 081 | . 000 | . 5760 | 1.0677 |
| MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.2719** | . 081 | . 000 | 1.0086 | 1.5352 |
|  | AAC 40 | .3594* | . 081 | . 000 | 9.981E-02 | . 6189 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -. 1969 | . 081 | . 345 | -. 4499 | $5.618 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | AAC 56 | -.6406** | . 081 | . 000 | -. 8781 | -. 4031 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | .8781* | . 081 | . 000 | . 6159 | 1.1404 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -.3969* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 6720 | -. 1218 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | $2.0938^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 1.8507 | 2.3368 |
| AAC 40 | MP3 40 | .9125* | . 081 | . 000 | . 6503 | 1.1747 |
|  | MP3 56 | -.3594* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 6189 | -9.98E-02 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -.5562* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 8082 | -. 3043 |
|  | AAC 56 | $-1.0000^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | -1.2363 | -. 7637 |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | .5188* | . 081 | . 000 | . 2576 | . 7799 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -.7563* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.0303 | -. 4822 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.7344* | . 081 | . 000 | 1.4925 | 1.9762 |
| AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | $1.4688^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 1.2130 | 1.7245 |
|  | MP3 56 | . 1969 | . 081 | . 345 | -5.62E-02 | 4499 |
|  | AAC 40 | .5562* | . 081 | . 000 | . 3043 | . 8082 |
|  | AAC 56 | -.4437* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 6729 | -. 2146 |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | 1.0750* | . 081 | . 000 | . 8203 | 1.3297 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 2000 | . 081 | . 424 | -. 4679 | $6.790 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | $2.2906^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 2.0558 | 2.5255 |
| AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 1.9125* | . 081 | . 000 | 1.6721 | 2.1529 |
|  | MP3 56 | . $6406{ }^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | . 4031 | . 8781 |
|  | AAC 40 | 1.0000* | . 081 | . 000 | . 7637 | 1.2363 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | .4437* | . 081 | . 000 | . 2146 | . 6729 |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | ${ }^{1.5187 *}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 1.2795 | 1.7580 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 2437 | . 081 | . 072 | -9.54E-03 | . 4970 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | $2.7344^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 2.5163 | 2.9524 |
| $\begin{array}{\|l\|} \hline \text { AAC } 40 \\ \text { scal } \end{array}$ | MP3 40 | . $3937 *$ | . 081 | . 000 | . 1289 | . 6586 |
|  | MP3 56 | -.8781* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.1404 | -. 6159 |
|  | AAC 40 | -.5188* | . 081 | . 000 | -. 7799 | -. 2576 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -1.0750* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.3297 | -. 8203 |
|  | AAC 56 | $-1.5187^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | -1.7580 | -1.2795 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | $-1.2750^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | -1.5516 | -. 9984 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.2156* | . 081 | . 000 | . 9709 | 1.4603 |
| AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | $1.6688^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 1.3912 | 1.9463 |
|  | MP3 56 | .3969* | . 081 | . 000 | . 1218 | . 6720 |
|  | AAC 40 | .7563* | . 081 | . 000 | . 4822 | 1.0303 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | . 2000 | . 081 | . 424 | -6.79E-02 | . 4679 |
|  | AAC 56 | -. 2437 | . 081 | . 072 | -. 4970 | $9.535 \mathrm{E}-03$ |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | 1.2750* | . 081 | . 000 | . 9984 | 1.5516 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | $2.4906^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | 2.2322 | 2.7491 |
| $\begin{array}{\|l} \hline \text { AAC } 40 \\ \text { BSAC } \end{array}$ | MP3 40 | -.8219* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.0677 | -. 5760 |
|  | MP3 56 | -2.0938* | . 081 | . 000 | -2.3368 | -1.8507 |
|  | AAC 40 | -1.7344* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.9762 | -1.4925 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -2.2906* | . 081 | . 000 | -2.5255 | -2.0558 |
|  | AAC 56 | -2.7344* | . 081 | . 000 | -2.9524 | -2.5163 |
|  | AAC 40 <br> scal | -1.2156* | . 081 | . 000 | -1.4603 | -. 9709 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | $-2.4906^{*}$ | . 081 | . 000 | -2.7491 | -2.2322 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 13. Test C, item-by-item comparison

|  |  |  | Multiple | parisons |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dependent Variable: SCORE Dunnett T3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ITEM | (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC | MeanDifference (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence Interval |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper <br> Bound |
| 3.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -. 6563 | . 274 | . 050 | -1.3125 | 1.145E-05 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -.7500* | . 274 | . 024 | -1.4238 | -7.62E-02 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | . 6563 | . 274 | . 050 | -1.15E-05 | 1.3125 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -9.38E-02 | . 274 | . 982 | -. 7794 | . 5919 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | .7500* | . 274 | . 024 | 7.623E-02 | 1.4238 |
|  |  | AAC 24 scal | $9.375 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 274 | . 982 | -. 5919 | . 7794 |
| 7.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -.7813* | . 255 | . 009 | -1.4050 | -. 1575 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -1.2188* | . 255 | . 000 | -1.8491 | -. 5884 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | .7813* | . 255 | . 009 | . 1575 | 1.4050 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -. 4375 | . 255 | . 246 | -1.0620 | . 1870 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.2188* | 255 | . 000 | . 5884 | 1.8491 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | . 4375 | . 255 | . 246 | -. 1870 | 1.0620 |
| 13.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -1.2813* | 238 | . 000 | -1.8220 | -. 7405 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -1.1250* | . 238 | . 000 | -1.7163 | -. 5337 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.2813* | . 238 | . 000 | . 7405 | 1.8220 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | . 1563 | . 238 | . 899 | -. 4604 | . 7729 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.1250* | 238 | . 000 | . 5337 | 1.7163 |
|  |  | AAC 24 scal | -. 1563 | . 238 | . 899 | -. 7729 | . 4604 |
| 14.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -1.0625* | . 255 | . 000 | -1.6939 | -. 4311 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -. 3125 | . 255 | . 593 | -. 9888 | . 3638 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.0625* | 255 | . 000 | . 4311 | 1.6939 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | .7500* | . 255 | . 006 | . 1829 | 1.3171 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | . 3125 | 255 | . 593 | -.3638 | . 9888 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | -.7500* | 255 | . 006 | -1.3171 | -. 1829 |
| 16.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -.8750* | . 306 | . 022 | -1.6484 | -. 1016 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -1.2813* | . 306 | . 000 | -2.0128 | -. 5497 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | .8750* | . 306 | . 022 | . 1016 | 1.6484 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | -. 4063 | .306 | . 456 | -1.1505 | . 3380 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.2813* | . 306 | . 000 | . 5497 | 2.0128 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | . 4063 | . 306 | . 456 | -.3380 | 1.1505 |
| 19.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -9.38E-02 | . 266 | . 982 | -. 7771 | . 5896 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -.9063* | . 266 | . 002 | -1.5254 | -. 2871 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 9.375E-02 | . 266 | . 982 | -. 5896 | . 7771 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | -.8125* | 266 | . 010 | -1.4637 | -. 1613 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | . $9063 *$ | . 266 | . 002 | . 2871 | 1.5254 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | .8125* | . 266 | . 010 | . 1613 | 1.4637 |
| 22.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -. 5313 | . 224 | . 087 | -1.1185 | $5.602 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -1.3125* | . 224 | . 000 | -1.8827 | -. 7423 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | . 5313 | . 224 | . 087 | -5.60E-02 | 1.1185 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | -.7813* | . 224 | . 001 | -1.2679 | -. 2946 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.3125* | . 224 | . 000 | . 7423 | 1.8827 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal |  | . 224 | . 001 | . 2946 | 1.2679 |
| 28.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -1.8438* | 238 | . 000 | -2.5063 | -1.1812 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -2.3438* | 238 | . 000 | -2.8951 | -1.7924 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.8438* | 238 | . 000 | 1.1812 | 2.5063 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | -. 5000 | . 238 | . 075 | -1.0367 | $3.666 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | $2.3438 *$ | . 238 | . 000 | 1.7924 | 2.8951 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | . 5000 | . 238 | . 075 | -3.67E-02 | 1.0367 |
| 33.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 <br> scal | -.8125* | 253 | . 004 | -1.3995 | -. 2255 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -.9063* | . 253 | . 003 | -1.5464 | -. 2661 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | . $8125^{*}$ | 253 | . 004 | . 2255 | 1.3995 |
|  | scal | AAC 24 | -9.38E-02 | . 253 | . 977 | -. 7301 | . 5426 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | .9063* | . 253 | . 003 | . 2661 | 1.5464 |
|  |  | AAC 24 <br> scal | 9.375E-02 | . 253 | . 977 | -.5426 | . 7301 |
| 38.00 | MP3 24 | AAC 24 scal | -1.0313* | . 261 | . 001 | -1.6712 | -. 3913 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -1.1250* | . 261 | . 000 | -1.7558 | -. 4942 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.0313* | 261 | . 001 | . 3913 | 1.6712 |
|  |  | AAC 24 | -9.38E-02 | . 261 | . 979 | -. 7442 | . 5567 |
|  | AAC 24 | MP3 24 | 1.1250* | . 261 | . 000 | . 4942 | 1.7558 |
|  |  | AAC 24 scal | 9.375E-02 | 261 | . 979 | -. 5567 | . 7442 |

*. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

Table 14. Test D, item-by-item comparison
(For this table, the significance marker (*) has been lost in re-formatting; however, the significance column gives the correct result.)

|  |  |  | Mean Diff (I-J) | Std. Error | Sig. | 95\% Confidence | Interval |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ITEM | (I) CODEC | (J) CODEC |  |  |  | Lower Bound | Upper Bound |
| 1.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.9063 | 222 | . 000 | -2.6075 | -1.2050 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.0000 | . 222 | . 003 | -1.7818 | -. 2182 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.6250 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.4181 | -. 8319 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.0625 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.8136 | -1.3114 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 2500 | . 222 | 1.000 | -1.1127 | . 6127 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.7592 | -1.4283 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 2500 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 5547 | 1.0547 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.9063 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.2050 | 2.6075 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 9063 | . 222 | . 001 | . 2542 | 1.5583 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 2813 | . 222 | . 990 | -.3855 | . 9480 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 1563 | 222 | 1.000 | -.7689 | 4564 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6563 | . 222 | . 000 | . 9047 | 2.4078 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 1875 | . 222 | 998 | -. 6816 | . 3066 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.4750 | 2.8375 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 1.0000 | . 222 | . 003 | . 2182 | 1.7818 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 9063 | . 222 | . 001 | -1.5583 | -. 2542 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 6250 | . 222 | . 211 | -1.3768 | . 1268 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.0625 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.7693 | -.3557 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 7500 | . 222 | . 113 | -7.5454E-02 | 1.5755 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.7061 | -. 4814 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.2500 | 222 | . 000 | . 4859 | 2.0141 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.6250 | . 222 | . 000 | . 8319 | 2.4181 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 2813 | . 222 | . 990 | -. 9480 | . 3855 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 6250 | . 222 | 211 | -. 1268 | 1.3768 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 4375 | . 222 | . 741 | -1.1573 | . 2823 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.3750 | . 222 | . 000 | . 5383 | 2.2117 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4688 | . 222 | . 367 | -1.0970 | . 1595 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.8750 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.0988 | 2.6512 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.0625 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.3114 | 2.8136 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 1563 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 4564 | . 7689 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.0625 | . 222 | . 000 | . 3557 | 1.7693 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 4375 | . 222 | . 741 | -. 2823 | 1.1573 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.8125 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.0149 | 2.6101 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -3.1250E-02 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 6007 | . 5382 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.3125 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.5794 | 3.0456 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 2500 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 6127 | 1.1127 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.6563 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.4078 | -. 9047 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 7500 | . 222 | . 113 | -1.5755 | $7.545 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.3750 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.2117 | -. 5383 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.8125 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.6101 | -1.0149 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.8438 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.5622 | -1.1253 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 5000 | . 222 | . 784 | -.3471 | 1.3471 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 2.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.4283 | 2.7592 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 1875 | . 222 | . 998 | -. 3066 | . 6816 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | . 4814 | 1.7061 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | 4688 | . 222 | . 367 | -. 1595 | 1.0970 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | $3.125 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 5382 | . 6007 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.8438 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.1253 | 2.5622 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.3438 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.6999 | 2.9876 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -. 2500 | . 222 | 1.000 | -1.0547 | . 5547 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.8375 | -1.4750 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.2500 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.0141 | -. 4859 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.8750 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.6512 | -1.0988 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.3125 | . 222 | . 000 | -3.0456 | -1.5794 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 5000 | . 222 | . 784 | -1.3471 | . 3471 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.3438 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.9876 | -1.6999 |
| 2.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -. 7188 | . 227 | . 184 | -1.5655 | . 1280 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.0313 | . 227 | . 002 | -1.8178 | -. 2447 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.5625 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.3870 | -. 7380 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.1250 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.8303 | -1.4197 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 4375 | . 227 | . 901 | -1.2620 | . 3870 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.9063 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.6785 | -1.1340 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 8750 | . 227 | . 032 | $4.011 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.7099 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | . 7188 | . 227 | . 184 | -. 1280 | 1.5655 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 3125 | . 227 | . 993 | -1.0671 | . 4421 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 8438 | . 227 | . 027 | -1.6379 | -4.9599E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.4063 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.0740 | -. 7385 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 2813 | . 227 | . 999 | -. 5129 | 1.0754 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.1875 | . 227 | . 000 | -1.9266 | -. 4484 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.5938 | . 227 | . 000 | . 7888 | 2.3987 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 1.0313 | . 227 | . 002 | . 2447 | 1.8178 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 3125 | . 227 | . 993 | -. 4421 | 1.0671 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 5313 | . 227 | . 419 | -1.2596 | . 1971 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.0938 | . 227 | . 000 | -1.6756 | -. 5119 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 5938 | . 227 | . 237 | -. 1346 | 1.3221 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 8750 | . 227 | . 002 | -1.5406 | -. 2094 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.9063 | . 227 | . 000 | 1.1662 | 2.6463 |


|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.5625 | . 227 | . 000 | . 7380 | 2.3870 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 8438 | . 227 | . 027 | $4.960 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.6379 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 5313 | . 227 | . 419 | -. 1971 | 1.2596 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 5625 | . 227 | . 136 | -1.1989 | 7.394E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.1250 | . 227 | . 000 | . 3553 | 1.8947 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 3438 | . 227 | . 958 | -1.0559 | 3684 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.4375 | . 227 | . 000 | 1.6566 | 3.2184 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.1250 | . 227 | . 000 | 1.4197 | 2.8303 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 1.4063 | . 227 | . 000 | . 7385 | 2.0740 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.0938 | . 227 | . 000 | . 5119 | 1.6756 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 5625 | . 227 | . 136 | -7.3942E-02 | 1.1989 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6875 | . 227 | . 000 | 1.0511 | 2.3239 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 2188 | . 227 | . 996 | -.3414 | . 7789 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.0000 | . 227 | . 000 | 2.3492 | 3.6508 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 4375 | . 227 | . 901 | -.3870 | 1.2620 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 2813 | . 227 | . 999 | -1.0754 | . 5129 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 5938 | . 227 | . 237 | -1.3221 | . 1346 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.1250 | . 227 | . 000 | -1.8947 | -. 3553 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.6875 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.3239 | -1.0511 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.4688 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.1809 | -. 7566 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.3125 | . 227 | . 000 | . 5316 | 2.0934 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 1.9063 | . 227 | . 000 | 1.1340 | 2.6785 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 1.1875 | . 227 | . 000 | . 4484 | 1.9266 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 8750 | . 227 | . 002 | . 2094 | 1.5406 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 3438 | . 227 | . 958 | -. 3684 | 1.0559 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 2188 | . 227 | . 996 | -. 7789 | 3414 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.4688 | . 227 | . 000 | . 7566 | 2.1809 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.7813 | . 227 | . 000 | 2.0570 | 3.5055 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | $-.8750$ | . 227 | . 032 | -1.7099 | -4.0109E-02 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.5938 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.3987 | -. 7888 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.9063 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.6463 | -1.1662 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.4375 | . 227 | . 000 | -3.2184 | -1.6566 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.0000 | . 227 | . 000 | -3.6508 | -2.3492 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.3125 | . 227 | . 000 | -2.0934 | -. 5316 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.7813 | . 227 | . 000 | -3.5055 | -2.0570 |
| 10.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | $-.2813$ | . 278 | 1.000 | -1.2515 | . 6890 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.1250 | . 278 | . 003 | -2.0088 | -. 2412 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | $-1.0000$ | . 278 | . 018 | -1.9052 | -9.4779E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.0313 | . 278 | . 007 | -1.8982 | $-.1643$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | $-.2500$ | . 278 | 1.000 | -1.1552 | . 6552 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.5000 | . 278 | . 000 | -2.3563 | -. 6437 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 9063 | . 278 | . 006 | . 1604 | 1.6521 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | . 2813 | . 278 | 1.000 | -.6890 | 1.2515 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 8438 | . 278 | . 196 | -1.8477 | . 1602 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 7188 | . 278 | . 487 | -1.7411 | . 3036 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 7500 | . 278 | . 351 | -1.7398 | 2398 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 3.125E-02 | . 278 | 1.000 | -.9911 | 1.0536 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.2188 | . 278 | . 004 | -2.2000 | $-.2375$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.1875 | . 278 | . 002 | . 2969 | 2.0781 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 1.1250 | . 278 | . 003 | . 2412 | 2.0088 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 8438 | . 278 | . 196 | -. 1602 | 1.8477 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 1250 | . 278 | 1.000 | -. 8170 | 1.0670 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | $9.375 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 278 | 1.000 | -. 8121 | . 9996 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 8750 | . 278 | . 095 | -6.7017E-02 | 1.8170 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 3750 | . 278 | . 992 | -1.2708 | . 5208 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0313 | . 278 | . 000 | 1.2389 | 2.8236 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.0000 | . 278 | . 018 | $9.478 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.9052 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 7188 | . 278 | . 487 | -. 3036 | 1.7411 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 1250 | . 278 | 1.000 | $-1.0670$ | . 8170 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.1250E-02 | . 278 | 1.000 | -.9574 | . 8949 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 7500 | . 278 | . 305 | -.2116 | 1.7116 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 5000 | . 278 | . 877 | -1.4169 | 4169 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.9063 | . 278 | . 000 | 1.0891 | 2.7234 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 1.0313 | . 278 | . 007 | . 1643 | 1.8982 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 7500 | . 278 | . 351 | -. 2398 | 1.7398 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -9.3750E-02 | . 278 | 1.000 | -. 9996 | . 8121 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | 3.125E-02 | . 278 | 1.000 | -.8949 | . 9574 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 7813 | . 278 | . 192 | -. 1449 | 1.7074 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4688 | . 278 | . 898 | -1.3479 | . 4104 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.9375 | . 278 | . 000 | 1.1648 | 2.7102 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 2500 | . 278 | 1.000 | -. 6552 | 1.1552 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -3.1250E-02 | . 278 | 1.000 | -1.0536 | . 9911 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 8750 | . 278 | . 095 | -1.8170 | 6.702E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 7500 | . 278 | . 305 | -1.7116 | . 2116 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 7813 | . 278 | . 192 | -1.7074 | . 1449 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.2500 | . 278 | . 001 | -2.1669 | -. 3331 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.1563 | . 278 | . 001 | . 3391 | 1.9734 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 1.5000 | . 278 | . 000 | . 6437 | 2.3563 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 1.2188 | . 278 | . 004 | . 2375 | 2.2000 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 3750 | . 278 | . 992 | -. 5208 | 1.2708 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 5000 | . 278 | . 877 | -. 4169 | 1.4169 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | . 4688 | . 278 | . 898 | -. 4104 | 1.3479 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.2500 | . 278 | . 001 | . 3331 | 2.1669 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.4063 | . 278 | . 000 | 1.6456 | 3.1669 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -. 9063 | . 278 | . 006 | -1.6521 | -. 1604 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.1875 | . 278 | . 002 | -2.0781 | $-.2969$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -2.0313 | . 278 | . 000 | -2.8236 | -1.2389 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.9063 | . 278 | . 000 | -2.7234 | -1.0891 |


|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.9375 | . 278 | . 000 | -2.7102 | -1.1648 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.1563 | . 278 | . 001 | -1.9734 | -. 3391 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.4063 | . 278 | . 000 | -3.1669 | -1.6456 |
| 11.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.1250 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.8508 | -. 3992 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 9688 | . 222 | . 001 | -1.6696 | -. 2679 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.2813 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.0343 | -. 5282 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.9688 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.6998 | -1.2377 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -6.2500E-02 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 8381 | 7131 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.2188 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.9081 | -1.5294 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.0313 | . 222 | . 000 | . 5116 | 1.5509 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.1250 | . 222 | . 000 | . 3992 | 1.8508 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 1563 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 5923 | . 9048 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 1563 | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 9529 | . 6404 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 8438 | . 222 | . 022 | -1.6201 | -6.7362E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.0625 | . 222 | . 002 | . 2445 | 1.8805 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.8320 | -.3555 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.5689 | 2.7436 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | . 9688 | . 222 | . 001 | . 2679 | 1.6696 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 1563 | . 222 | 1.000 | -.9048 | . 5923 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 3125 | . 222 | . 995 | -1.0875 | . 4625 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.0000 | . 222 | . 002 | -1.7536 | -. 2464 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 9063 | . 222 | . 013 | . 1093 | 1.7032 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.2500 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.9638 | -. 5362 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0000 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.4459 | 2.5541 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.2813 | . 222 | . 000 | . 5282 | 2.0343 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 1563 | . 222 | 1.000 | -.6404 | . 9529 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 3125 | . 222 | . 995 | -. 4625 | 1.0875 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 6875 | . 222 | . 172 | -1.4889 | 1139 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.2188 | . 222 | . 000 | . 3775 | 2.0600 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 9375 | . 222 | . 005 | -1.7021 | -. 1729 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.3125 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.6895 | 2.9355 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 1.9688 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.2377 | 2.6998 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 8438 | . 222 | . 022 | 6.736E-02 | 1.6201 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.0000 | . 222 | . 022 | . 2464 | 1.7536 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 6875 | . 222 | . 172 | -. 1139 | 1.4889 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.9063 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.0836 | 2.7289 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | $-.2500$ | . 222 | 1.000 | -. 9934 | . 4934 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.0000 | . 222 | . 000 | 2.4059 | 3.5941 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | $6.250 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 222 | 1.000 | -.7131 | . 8381 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.0625 | . 222 | . 002 | -1.8805 | -. 2445 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 9063 | . 222 | . 013 | -1.7032 | -. 1093 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.2188 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.0600 | -. 3775 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.9063 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.7289 | -1.0836 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.9431 | -1.3694 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | . 4428 | 1.7447 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 2.2188 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.5294 | 2.9081 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | 1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | . 3555 | 1.8320 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.2500 | . 222 | . 000 | . 5362 | 1.9638 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | 9375 | . 222 | . 005 | . 1729 | 1.7021 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | 2500 | . 222 | 1.000 | -.4934 | . 9934 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | 1.3694 | 2.9431 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.2500 | . 222 | . 000 | 2.7113 | 3.7887 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -1.0313 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.5509 | -. 5116 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.1563 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.7436 | -1.5689 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -2.0000 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.5541 | -1.4459 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.3125 | . 222 | . 000 | -2.9355 | -1.6895 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.0000 | . 222 | . 000 | -3.5941 | -2.4059 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.0938 | . 222 | . 000 | -1.7447 | -. 4428 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -3.2500 | . 222 | . 000 | -3.7887 | -2.7113 |
| 13.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.8125 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.4875 | -1.1375 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.0625 | . 233 | . 001 | -1.8213 | -. 3037 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.6563 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.3956 | -.9169 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.4063 | . 233 | . 000 | -3.1038 | -1.7087 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -.5625 | . 233 | . 321 | -1.2915 | . 1665 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.2813 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.9999 | -1.5626 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 2188 | . 233 | 1.000 | -. 4609 | . 8984 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.8125 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.1375 | 2.4875 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 7500 | . 233 | . 069 | -2.7675E-02 | 1.5277 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 1563 | . 233 | 1.000 | -. 6025 | . 9150 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 5938 | . 233 | . 219 | -1.3124 | . 1249 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.2500 | . 233 | . 000 | . 5008 | 1.9992 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4688 | . 233 | . 673 | -1.2079 | . 2704 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0313 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.3295 | 2.7330 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 1.0625 | . 233 | . 001 | . 3037 | 1.8213 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -.7500 | . 233 | . 069 | -1.5277 | $2.767 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 5938 | . 233 | . 460 | -1.4255 | . 2380 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.3438 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.1401 | -.5474 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 5000 | . 233 | . 743 | -.3231 | 1.3231 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.2188 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.0327 | -. 4048 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.2813 | . 233 | . 000 | . 4995 | 2.0630 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.6563 | . 233 | . 000 | . 9169 | 2.3956 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 1563 | . 233 | 1.000 | -.9150 | . 6025 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 5938 | . 233 | . 460 | -. 2380 | 1.4255 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 7500 | . 233 | . 070 | -1.5284 | $2.841 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.0938 | . 233 | . 001 | . 2880 | 1.8995 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 6250 | . 233 | . 295 | -1.4214 | . 1714 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.8750 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.1121 | 2.6379 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.4063 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.7087 | 3.1038 |


|  |  | MP3 56 | . 5938 | . 233 | . 219 | -. 1249 | 1.3124 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.3438 | . 233 | . 000 | . 5474 | 2.1401 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 7500 | . 233 | . 070 | -2.8410E-02 | 1.5284 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.8438 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.0751 | 2.6124 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 1250 | . 233 | 1.000 | -. 6339 | . 8839 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.6250 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.9020 | 3.3480 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 5625 | . 233 | . 321 | -. 1665 | 1.2915 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.2500 | . 233 | . 000 | -1.9992 | -. 5008 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 5000 | . 233 | . 743 | -1.3231 | . 3231 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.0938 | . 233 | . 001 | -1.8995 | -. 2880 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.8438 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.6124 | -1.0751 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.7188 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.5062 | -. 9313 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 7813 | . 233 | . 035 | $2.781 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 1.5347 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 2.2813 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.5626 | 2.9999 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 4688 | . 233 | . 673 | -. 2704 | 1.2079 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.2188 | . 233 | . 000 | . 4048 | 2.0327 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 6250 | . 233 | . 295 | -. 1714 | 1.4214 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 1250 | . 233 | 1.000 | -. 8839 | . 6339 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.7188 | . 233 | . 000 | . 9313 | 2.5062 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.5000 | . 233 | . 000 | 1.7566 | 3.2434 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -. 2188 | . 233 | 1.000 | -. 8984 | . 4609 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.0313 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.7330 | -1.3295 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.2813 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.0630 | -. 4995 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.8750 | . 233 | . 000 | -2.6379 | -1.1121 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.6250 | . 233 | . 000 | -3.3480 | -1.9020 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 7813 | . 233 | . 035 | $-1.5347$ | -2.7806E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.5000 | . 233 | . 000 | -3.2434 | -1.7566 |
| 18.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -2.0313 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.8044 | -1.2581 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | $-1.0000$ | . 199 | . 004 | -1.7974 | -. 2026 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.9321 | $-1.5679$ |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.9757 | -1.5868 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 6250 | . 199 | . 309 | -1.4285 | 1785 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.9457 | -1.5543 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.0000 | . 199 | . 001 | . 2972 | 1.7028 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 2.0313 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.2581 | 2.8044 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.0313 | . 199 | . 001 | . 3016 | 1.7609 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 2188 | . 199 | . 998 | -. 8159 | . 3784 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 2500 | . 199 | . 993 | -.8620 | . 3620 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.4063 | . 199 | . 000 | . 6689 | 2.1436 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 2188 | . 199 | . 999 | -. 8321 | . 3946 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.0313 | . 199 | . 000 | 2.4097 | 3.6528 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 1.0000 | . 199 | . 004 | . 2026 | 1.7974 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.0313 | . 199 | . 001 | -1.7609 | -. 3016 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | $-1.2500$ | . 199 | . 000 | -1.8805 | -. 6195 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | -1.9256 | -. 6369 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 3750 | . 199 | . 951 | -. 3878 | 1.1378 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | -1.8956 | -. 6044 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0000 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.3467 | 2.6533 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 2.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.5679 | 2.9321 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 2188 | . 199 | . 998 | -. 3784 | . 8159 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | . 6195 | 1.8805 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.1250E-02 | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 5103 | . 4478 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6250 | . 199 | . 000 | . 9860 | 2.2640 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 0000 | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 4811 | . 4811 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | 2.7580 | 3.7420 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.5868 | 2.9757 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 2500 | . 199 | . 993 | -.3620 | . 8620 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | . 6369 | 1.9256 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | 3.125E-02 | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 4478 | . 5103 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6563 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.0031 | 2.3094 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | $3.125 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 4695 | . 5320 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | 2.7700 | 3.7925 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 6250 | . 199 | . 309 | -. 1785 | 1.4285 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.4063 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.1436 | -. 6689 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 3750 | . 199 | . 951 | -1.1378 | . 3878 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.6250 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.2640 | -.9860 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.6563 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.3094 | -1.0031 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.6250 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.2795 | -. 9705 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.6250 | . 199 | . 000 | . 9635 | 2.2865 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 2.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | 1.5543 | 2.9457 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 2188 | . 199 | . 999 | -. 3946 | . 8321 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | . 6044 | 1.8956 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 0000 | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 4811 | . 4811 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.1250E-02 | . 199 | 1.000 | -. 5320 | . 4695 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6250 | . 199 | . 000 | . 9705 | 2.2795 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | 2.7371 | 3.7629 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | $-1.0000$ | . 199 | . 001 | -1.7028 | -. 2972 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -3.0313 | . 199 | . 000 | -3.6528 | -2.4097 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -2.0000 | . 199 | . 000 | -2.6533 | -1.3467 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -3.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | -3.7420 | -2.7580 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.2813 | . 199 | . 000 | -3.7925 | -2.7700 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | $-1.6250$ | . 199 | . 000 | -2.2865 | -.9635 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -3.2500 | . 199 | . 000 | -3.7629 | -2.7371 |
| 20.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | $-1.1563$ | . 247 | . 002 | -2.0460 | -. 2665 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -.5938 | . 247 | . 708 | -1.5502 | . 3627 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.4688 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.3991 | -. 5384 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.0000 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.8615 | -1.1385 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 5938 | . 247 | . 727 | -1.5606 | . 3731 |


|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 4063 | . 247 | . 961 | -. 4488 | 1.2613 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 9375 | . 247 | . 011 | . 1260 | 1.7490 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.1563 | . 247 | . 002 | 2665 | 2.0460 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 5625 | . 247 | . 558 | -. 2694 | 1.3944 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 3125 | . 247 | . 997 | -1.1128 | . 4878 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 8438 | . 247 | . 008 | -1.5582 | -. 1293 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 5625 | . 247 | . 586 | -. 2827 | 1.4077 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 1.5625 | . 247 | . 000 | . 8557 | 2.2693 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0938 | . 247 | . 000 | 1.4438 | 2.7437 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | . 5938 | . 247 | . 708 | -. 3627 | 1.5502 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -.5625 | . 247 | . 558 | -1.3944 | . 2694 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 8750 | . 247 | . 050 | -1.7509 | $8.837 \mathrm{E}-04$ |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.2074 | -. 6051 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 0000 | . 247 | 1.000 | -. 9159 | . 9159 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 1.0000 | . 247 | . 004 | . 2057 | 1.7943 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.5313 | . 247 | . 000 | . 7853 | 2.2772 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.4688 | . 247 | . 000 | . 5384 | 2.3991 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 3125 | . 247 | . 997 | -. 4878 | 1.1128 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 8750 | . 247 | . 050 | -8.8371E-04 | 1.7509 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 5313 | . 247 | . 514 | -1.2989 | 2364 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 8750 | . 247 | . 058 | -1.3535E-02 | 1.7635 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 1.8750 | . 247 | . 000 | 1.1146 | 2.6354 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.4063 | 247 | . 000 | 1.6970 | 3.1155 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.0000 | 247 | . 000 | 1.1385 | 2.8615 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 8438 | . 247 | . 008 | . 1293 | 1.5582 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | . 6051 | 2.2074 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 5313 | . 247 | . 514 | -. 2364 | 1.2989 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | . 5918 | 2.2207 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 2.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | 1.7384 | 3.0741 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.9375 | . 247 | . 000 | 2.3314 | 3.5436 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 5938 | . 247 | . 727 | -. 3731 | 1.5606 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 5625 | . 247 | . 586 | -1.4077 | . 2827 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 0000 | . 247 | 1.000 | -.9159 | . 9159 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 8750 | . 247 | . 058 | -1.7635 | $1.354 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.2207 | -. 5918 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | 1.0000 | . 247 | . 005 | 1917 | 1.8083 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.5313 | . 247 | . 000 | . 7701 | 2.2924 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | -. 4063 | . 247 | . 961 | -1.2613 | . 4488 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | $-1.5625$ | . 247 | . 000 | -2.2693 | -.8557 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | $-1.0000$ | . 247 | . 004 | -1.7943 | -. 2057 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.8750 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.6354 | -1.1146 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | -3.0741 | -1.7384 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | $-1.0000$ | . 247 | . 005 | -1.8083 | -. 1917 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 5313 | . 247 | . 131 | -6.5274E-02 | 1.1278 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -.9375 | . 247 | . 011 | -1.7490 | -. 1260 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.0938 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.7437 | -1.4438 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.5313 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.2772 | -. 7853 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.4063 | . 247 | . 000 | -3.1155 | -1.6970 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.9375 | . 247 | . 000 | -3.5436 | -2.3314 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.5313 | . 247 | . 000 | -2.2924 | -. 7701 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 5313 | . 247 | . 131 | -1.1278 | $6.527 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
| 31.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.3438 | . 207 | . 000 | -1.9911 | -. 6964 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 9063 | . 207 | . 009 | -1.6792 | -. 1333 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.4063 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.0775 | -. 7350 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.7813 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.4338 | -1.1287 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 6563 | . 207 | . 123 | -1.3868 | 7.430E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.8438 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.4760 | -1.2115 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | . 6875 | . 207 | . 192 | -. 1282 | 1.5032 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.3438 | . 207 | . 000 | . 6964 | 1.9911 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 4375 | . 207 | . 637 | -. 2422 | 1.1172 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -6.2500E-02 | . 207 | 1.000 | -. 6168 | . 4918 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 4375 | . 207 | . 219 | -. 9669 | $9.193 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 6875 | . 207 | . 020 | 5.925E-02 | 1.3158 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 5000 | . 207 | . 052 | -1.0024 | $2.397 \mathrm{E}-03$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0313 | . 207 | . 000 | 1.3026 | 2.7599 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | . 9063 | . 207 | . 009 | . 1333 | 1.6792 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 4375 | . 207 | . 637 | -1.1172 | . 2422 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 5000 | . 207 | . 458 | -1.2017 | . 2017 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 8750 | . 207 | . 003 | -1.5590 | -. 1910 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 2500 | . 207 | 1.000 | -. 5081 | 1.0081 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 9375 | . 207 | . 001 | -1.6024 | -. 2726 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.5938 | . 207 | . 000 | . 7543 | 2.4332 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.4063 | . 207 | . 000 | . 7350 | 2.0775 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | $6.250 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 207 | 1.000 | -. 4918 | . 6168 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 5000 | . 207 | . 458 | -. 2017 | 1.2017 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 3750 | . 207 | . 578 | -. 9349 | . 1849 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 7500 | . 207 | . 012 | 9.710E-02 | 1.4029 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4375 | . 207 | . 233 | -. 9727 | $9.767 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0938 | . 207 | . 000 | 1.3443 | 2.8432 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 1.7813 | . 207 | . 000 | 1.1287 | 2.4338 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 4375 | . 207 | . 219 | -9.1934E-02 | . 9669 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 8750 | . 207 | . 003 | . 1910 | 1.5590 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 3750 | . 207 | . 578 | -. 1849 | . 9349 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.1250 | . 207 | . 000 | . 4914 | 1.7586 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -6.2500E-02 | . 207 | 1.000 | -. 5718 | . 4468 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.4688 | . 207 | . 000 | 1.7354 | 3.2021 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 6563 | . 207 | . 123 | -7.4297E-02 | 1.3868 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 6875 | . 207 | . 020 | -1.3158 | -5.9248E-02 |


|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 2500 | 207 | 1.000 | -1.0081 | . 5081 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -.7500 | 207 | . 012 | -1.4029 | -9.7102E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.1250 | 207 | . 000 | -1.7586 | -. 4914 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.1875 | 207 | . 000 | -1.8000 | -. 5750 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.3438 | . 207 | . 000 | . 5427 | 2.1448 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 1.8438 | 207 | . 000 | 1.2115 | 2.4760 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 5000 | . 207 | . 052 | -2.3973E-03 | 1.0024 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 9375 | 207 | . 001 | . 2726 | 1.6024 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 4375 | . 207 | . 233 | -9.7667E-02 | . 9727 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | $6.250 \mathrm{E}-02$ | 207 | 1.000 | -. 4468 | . 5718 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.1875 | . 207 | . 000 | . 5750 | 1.8000 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.5313 | . 207 | . 000 | 1.8153 | 3.2472 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -. 6875 | . 207 | . 192 | -1.5032 | . 1282 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.0313 | . 207 | . 020 | -2.7599 | -1.3026 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.5938 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.4332 | -. 7543 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.0938 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.8432 | -1.3443 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.4688 | . 207 | . 000 | -3.2021 | -1.7354 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.3438 | . 207 | . 000 | -2.1448 | -.5427 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.5313 | . 207 | . 000 | -3.2472 | -1.8153 |
| 33.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -1.4688 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.2257 | -. 7118 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 5313 | . 224 | . 526 | -1.3025 | . 2400 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -1.1875 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.0070 | -.3680 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -2.0000 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.7158 | -1.2842 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 3125 | . 224 | . 991 | -1.0529 | . 4279 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.6875 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.5134 | -. 8616 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.0938 | 224 | . 000 | . 4247 | 1.7628 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | 1.4688 | . 224 | . 000 | . 7118 | 2.2257 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 9375 | . 224 | . 003 | . 2095 | 1.6655 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | 2813 | . 224 | . 999 | -.4988 | 1.0613 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 5313 | 224 | . 272 | -1.1986 | . 1361 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.1563 | . 224 | . 000 | . 4621 | 1.8504 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 2188 | . 224 | 1.000 | -1.0056 | . 5681 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.5625 | . 224 | . 000 | 1.9462 | 3.1788 |
|  | AAC 40 | MP3 40 | 5313 | 224 | . 526 | -. 2400 | 1.3025 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 9375 | . 224 | . 003 | -1.6655 | -. 2095 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 6563 | . 224 | . 218 | -1.4501 | . 1376 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.4688 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.1533 | -. 7842 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 2188 | 224 | 1.000 | -. 4920 | . 9295 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.1563 | . 224 | . 000 | -1.9568 | -.3557 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.6250 | . 224 | . 000 | . 9899 | 2.2601 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.1875 | . 224 | . 000 | . 3680 | 2.0070 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -. 2813 | . 224 | . 999 | -1.0613 | . 4988 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | . 6563 | . 224 | . 218 | -. 1376 | 1.4501 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 8125 | . 224 | . 020 | -1.5527 | -7.2299E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 8750 | . 224 | . 012 | . 1111 | 1.6389 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 5000 | . 224 | . 784 | -1.3466 | . 3466 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.2813 | . 224 | . 000 | 1.5851 | 2.9774 |
|  | AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 2.0000 | . 224 | . 000 | 1.2842 | 2.7158 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 5313 | . 224 | . 272 | -. 1361 | 1.1986 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.4688 | . 224 | . 000 | . 7842 | 2.1533 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 8125 | . 224 | . 020 | 7.230E-02 | 1.5527 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.6875 | . 224 | . 000 | 1.0401 | 2.3349 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 3125 | . 224 | . 991 | -. 4349 | 1.0599 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 3.0938 | . 224 | . 000 | 2.5330 | 3.6545 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 3125 | . 224 | . 991 | -.4279 | 1.0529 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -1.1563 | . 224 | . 000 | -1.8504 | -. 4621 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | $-.2188$ | . 224 | 1.000 | -.9295 | . 4920 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 8750 | . 224 | . 012 | -1.6389 | -. 1111 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.6875 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.3349 | -1.0401 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.3750 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.1459 | -. 6041 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.4063 | . 224 | . 000 | . 8122 | 2.0003 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 1.6875 | . 224 | . 000 | . 8616 | 2.5134 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | . 2188 | . 224 | 1.000 | -.5681 | 1.0056 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | 1.1563 | . 224 | . 000 | . 3557 | 1.9568 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | . 5000 | . 224 | . 784 | -.3466 | 1.3466 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 3125 | . 224 | . 991 | -1.0599 | . 4349 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | 1.3750 | . 224 | . 000 | . 6041 | 2.1459 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.7813 | . 224 | . 000 | 2.0773 | 3.4852 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -1.0938 | . 224 | . 000 | -1.7628 | -. 4247 |
|  |  | MP3 56 | -2.5625 | . 224 | . 000 | -3.1788 | -1.9462 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -1.6250 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.2601 | -.9899 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -2.2813 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.9774 | -1.5851 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -3.0938 | . 224 | . 000 | -3.6545 | -2.5330 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -1.4063 | . 224 | . 000 | -2.0003 | -. 8122 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.7813 | . 224 | . 000 | -3.4852 | -2.0773 |
| 37.00 | MP3 40 | MP3 56 | -. 8750 | . 246 | . 107 | -1.8320 | $8.197 \mathrm{E}-02$ |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -. 9063 | . 246 | . 085 | -1.8690 | 5.646E-02 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | $-1.2500$ | . 246 | . 001 | -2.1129 | -. 3871 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -1.4688 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.3453 | -. 5922 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | -. 1875 | . 246 | 1.000 | -1.1733 | . 7983 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.3125 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.2209 | -. 4041 |
|  |  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.2188 | . 246 | . 004 | . 2375 | 2.2000 |
|  | MP3 56 | MP3 40 | . 8750 | . 246 | . 107 | -8.1967E-02 | 1.8320 |
|  |  | AAC 40 | -3.1250E-02 | . 246 | 1.000 | -.8493 | . 7868 |
|  |  | AAC 56 scal | -. 3750 | . 246 | . 872 | -1.0650 | . 3150 |
|  |  | AAC 56 | -. 5938 | . 246 | . 198 | -1.3024 | . 1149 |
|  |  | AAC 40 scal | . 6875 | . 246 | . 243 | -. 1591 | 1.5341 |
|  |  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4375 | . 246 | . 797 | -1.1868 | . 3118 |


|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.0938 | . 246 | . 000 | 1.2533 | 2.9342 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| AAC 40 | MP3 40 | . 9063 | . 246 | . 085 | -5.6458E-02 | 1.8690 |
|  | MP3 56 | $3.125 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 7868 | . 8493 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -. 3438 | . 246 | . 944 | -1.0418 | . 3543 |
|  | AAC 56 | -. 5625 | . 246 | . 290 | -1.2789 | . 1539 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | . 7188 | . 246 | . 193 | -. 1343 | 1.5718 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -. 4063 | . 246 | . 890 | -1.1629 | . 3504 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.1250 | . 246 | . 000 | 1.2780 | 2.9720 |
| AAC 56 scal | MP3 40 | 1.2500 | . 246 | . 001 | . 3871 | 2.1129 |
|  | MP3 56 | . 3750 | . 246 | . 872 | -.3150 | 1.0650 |
|  | AAC 40 | . 3438 | . 246 | . 944 | -. 3543 | 1.0418 |
|  | AAC 56 | -. 2188 | . 246 | . 996 | -. 7752 | . 3377 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | 1.0625 | . 246 | . 000 | . 3294 | 1.7956 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -6.2500E-02 | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 6731 | . 5481 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.4688 | . 246 | . 000 | 1.7428 | 3.1947 |
| AAC 56 | MP3 40 | 1.4688 | . 246 | . 000 | . 5922 | 2.3453 |
|  | MP3 56 | . 5938 | . 246 | . 198 | -. 1149 | 1.3024 |
|  | AAC 40 | . 5625 | . 246 | . 290 | -. 1539 | 1.2789 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | . 2188 | . 246 | . 996 | -. 3377 | . 7752 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | 1.2813 | . 246 | . 000 | . 5309 | 2.0316 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | . 1563 | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 4763 | . 7888 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.6875 | . 246 | . 000 | 1.9441 | 3.4309 |
| AAC 40 scal | MP3 40 | . 1875 | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 7983 | 1.1733 |
|  | MP3 56 | -. 6875 | . 246 | . 243 | -1.5341 | . 1591 |
|  | AAC 40 | -. 7188 | . 246 | . 193 | -1.5718 | . 1343 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -1.0625 | . 246 | . 000 | -1.7956 | -. 3294 |
|  | AAC 56 | -1.2813 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.0316 | -. 5309 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -1.1250 | . 246 | . 001 | -1.9136 | -. 3364 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 1.4063 | . 246 | . 000 | . 5317 | 2.2808 |
| AAC 56 BSAC | MP3 40 | 1.3125 | . 246 | . 000 | . 4041 | 2.2209 |
|  | MP3 56 | . 4375 | . 246 | . 797 | -. 3118 | 1.1868 |
|  | AAC 40 | . 4063 | . 246 | . 890 | -.3504 | 1.1629 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | $6.250 \mathrm{E}-02$ | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 5481 | . 6731 |
|  | AAC 56 | -. 1563 | . 246 | 1.000 | -. 7888 | . 4763 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | 1.1250 | . 246 | . 001 | . 3364 | 1.9136 |
|  | AAC 40 BSAC | 2.5313 | . 246 | . 000 | 1.7498 | 3.3127 |
| AAC 40 BSAC | MP3 40 | -1.2188 | . 246 | . 004 | -2.2000 | -. 2375 |
|  | MP3 56 | -2.0938 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.9342 | -1.2533 |
|  | AAC 40 | -2.1250 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.9720 | -1.2780 |
|  | AAC 56 scal | -2.4688 | . 246 | . 000 | -3.1947 | -1.7428 |
|  | AAC 56 | -2.6875 | . 246 | . 000 | -3.4309 | -1.9441 |
|  | AAC 40 scal | -1.4063 | . 246 | . 000 | -2.2808 | -. 5317 |
|  | AAC 56 BSAC | -2.5313 | . 246 | . 000 | -3.3127 | -1.7498 |


[^0]:    C: Critical item, Ty: Typical item, TR: Training item,

    * : level adjustment was done

[^1]:    *. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

[^2]:    *. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

[^3]:    *. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

[^4]:    *. The mean difference is significant at the .05 level.

